



DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING, HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENT

Neighborhood Services Division

Courthouse Plaza One 2100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22201
TEL 703.228.3830 FAX 703.228.3834 www.arlingtonva.us

DRAFT

MINUTES OF THE HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD

**Wednesday, December 20, 2017
2100 Clarendon Boulevard
Lobby Rooms Cherry and Dogwood**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Charles Craig
Robert Dudka
Sarah Garner
Gerry Laporte
Joan Lawrence, Chairman
Sara Steinberger
Andrew Wenchel
Mark Turnbull

MEMBERS EXCUSED:

John Peck
Tova Solo
Carmela Hamm
Richard Woodruff, Vice Chairman
Mitchell Zink

STAFF:

Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Historic Preservation Coordinator
Rebeccah Ballo, Historic Preservation Planner
John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner
Kyle Fisher, Historic Preservation Management Intern

ROLL CALL & CALL TO ORDER

The Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:31 PM. Mr. Liebertz called the roll and determined there was a quorum.

The Chairman called for any public speakers. None came forward.

APPROVAL OF THE NOVEMBER 15, 2017, MEETING MINUTES

The Chairman called for any changes to the November 15, 2017, draft meeting minutes. Mr. Dudka called for a correction to his comments on page 6, paragraph 3, and page 7. The Chairman called for a motion. Mr. Dudka moved to approve the November 15, 2017, minutes as amended. Mr. Laporte seconded and the motion passed 7-0-1 (Mr. Turnbull abstained).

PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS (CoAs)

The Chairman stated there was one item that had been moved from the consent agenda to the discussion agenda.

CONSENT AGENDA:

1. David & Linea Toepel
2206 North Kenmore Street
CoA 15-22B (HP1700053)
Maywood Historic District
An after-the-fact request to install two window wells.

The Chairman called for a motion on the consent agenda. Mr. Laporte moved to approve the consent agenda as submitted. Ms. Steinberger seconded and the motion passed 8-0-0.

DISCUSSION AGENDA:

1. Ballston Retail LLC
Buckingham Village Shopping Center
CoA 16-20B (HP1700040)
Buckingham Historic District
A request to amend CoA 16-20 for alterations to the awning boxes on the commercial storefronts.
2. Arlington Historical Society
5620 3rd Street South
CoA 16-19B (HP1700054)
Ball-Sellers House Historic District
A request to extend CoA 16-19B for an additional year.

Discussion Agenda Item #1: Buckingham Village Shopping Center

Ms. Rachel Sposa from Ballston Retail, LLC, presented the proposal. She explained the item had been moved from the consent agenda to the discussion agenda because Ballston Retail, LLC., does not wish to proceed with the DRC’s recommendation with respect to the design of the awning box. The proposal retains the design as it was originally presented.

Mr. Dudka said the consensus of the DRC was that there should be a single awning box replacement that recalls the original design. The two original covers should be preserved as well.

Mr. Liebertz provided background for the case. In 2016, the HALRB approved renovation of the commercial storefronts. The board stipulated that the existing awning boxes remain in place. However, during renovation, all but two of the original awning boxes were removed. He added that the board should consider how to treat the remaining historic awning boxes and the awning boxes accidentally removed. Mr. Liebertz stated that the DRC recommended preserving the two remaining historic boxes while replacing the removed boxes with a new design.

Mr. Dudka added that the DRC proposed inserting an aluminum bar between the channels to make the new boxes more compatible with the existing historic box design. He asked Ms. Sposa to explain the applicant's reasoning for rejecting this design.

Ms. Sposa said the applicant showed the DRC's proposed design to the subcontractor, who had concerns that water could be trapped inside the boxes. She noted that this would defeat the purpose of the applicant's intention to make a watertight awning box replacement.

Mr. Liebertz added that HPP staff recommended approval of either design option. Mr. Liebertz asked Ms. Sposa if the awnings themselves would actually prevent water from entering the subject boxes.

Ms. Sposa responded that water could still come down the building façade. She added that the DRC's proposed design provided a reveal that could trap water inside the box.

The Chairman asked if pictures of windows 8 and 7 show vertically-oriented panels rather than the horizontally-oriented panels proposed for the new design.

Ms. Sposa stated that that is correct. Windows 8 and 7 are not historic and that the storefront will come up to where the historic boxes used to be located.

Mr. Liebertz reminded the board that only awning boxes for windows 6 and 5 are historic and will remain. He noted that any future restoration will use these as a design precedent.

Mr. Dudka asked the board to consider to what extent the new awning box covers should emulate the original design. Staff recommends either is design is sufficient. Mr. Dudka stated that if the board feels the applicant's proposed design is insufficient, they will have to request additional alternatives.

Ms. Steinberger asked if each horizontal slat on the proposed design overlaps. Ms. Sposa responded that the slats do not overlap.

The Chairman moved to approve the proposed new awning box covers to replace those that were removed and restore the two historic boxes that remain. Mr. Zink seconded. The motion passed 7-0-1 with Mr. Dudka abstaining.

Discussion Agenda Item #2: Ball Sellers House Historic District

Mr. Laporte discussed the application and how he had believed the HALRB-approved work had been completed in Spring 2016. Mr. Liebertz responded that the majority of the work had been completed, but elements associated with the stone outline remained incomplete due to scheduling of the volunteer workforce and weather. He added that the extension of the CoA would allow them to extend their work to uncover the outline of an original stone foundation.

The Chairman moved to approve CoA 16-19B. Mr. Laporte seconded. The motion passed 8-0-0.

DISCUSSION ITEM: 4333 ARLINGTON BOULEVARD – RED CROSS/TRENTON STREET, SITE PLAN #446

Sara Mariska, attorney from Walsh-Colucci and representing the developer, Wesley Housing, introduced the project. She noted the following:

- Wesley Housing is rezoning and making a new site plan for its property Whitfield Commons, its new acquisition, the Red Cross building along Arlington Boulevard, and two adjacent single-family houses (a total of about 4 acres);
- Whitfield Commons will be retained as is with the possible exception of some added trees to the site and smaller interior changes;
- A 117-unit affordable housing apartment is proposed for the remainder of the site currently occupied by the former Red Cross building and the two single-family houses; and
- Wesley Housing has partnered with Madison Homes to do 19 townhouses on the site of the current single-family houses.

Ms. Ballo added that Whitfield Commons is listed as “Important” on the Historic Resources Inventory, which requires the HALRB to comment on this proposal. She noted that the Buckingham Village National Register District is also adjacent to the site and that the County has discussed obtaining an historic preservation easement for Whitfield Commons. Ms. Ballo stated that this proposal has been through two SPRC hearings where participants have expressed concerns over the architectural compatibility between the proposed design and that of Buckingham Village and Whitfield Commons. She suggested that the HALRB focus comments on architectural compatibility and an easement.

The Chairman asked if transfer-of-development rights (TDRs) had been suggested.

Ms. Ballo replied that there were no proposed TDRs as there is no excess density available to transfer.

Ms. Mariska said that the applicant would like to resume discussions about obtaining bonus density in exchange for an historic preservation easement. She added that recent discussions had not been supportive of awarding the applicant bonus density in exchange for an easement. She stated that the team has looked at precedents in areas such as Clarendon where bonus density in the form of TDRs has been granted. He added that the applicant would welcome discussion about bonus density from TDRs in exchange for historic preservation easements.

Ms. Ballo said that unlike Clarendon, which is governed by a sector plan, there is no plan guidance for this site. She noted that the GLUP designation, underlying zoning, and the HRI apply here.

Rob McClenan, Bonstra Haresign Architects, presented the design for the Whitfield Commons and Red Cross portion of the site. Jeremy Arnold, Bonstra Haresign Architects, provided additional information about the project from a presentation given at the second SPRC meeting. Eric Stoddard, WC Ralston presented the plan for the townhouses.

Mr. Arnold presented samples of proposed building materials, including several brick samples and stucco. He noted that there would be further discussion about whether stucco or an Exterior Insulation and Finishing System (EIFS) would be used.

Mr. Craig asked if this would be a stick-built structure and the substrate material. Mr. Arnold replied it would be stick-built and be an exterior gypsum product. He added that the stucco would be applied with a trowel and there would be a reveal joint placed between sections of stucco. Mr. Arnold noted that the red brick material comes from the surrounding neighborhood.

The Chairman asked if the stucco section on Trenton Street elevation was a visual rather than an actual setback. Mr. McClenan said that it is a 3” setback, but a 20” setback may be a possibility.

Mr. Dudka asked the presenters if there were additional images of the buildings that would give more clarity about their placement. He stated that it was too difficult to discuss the context of the project when there were not enough actual context images provided of the site.

Mr. McClenan and Mr. Arnold responded that they did not have additional images with them.

Mr. Dudka replied that it was difficult to evaluate the context without more images. Mr. Laporte stated he was having the same difficulty.

Mr. Arnold used Google Maps to show the site. He noted specific buildings on Arlington Boulevard as well as the grade change.

Mr. Craig asked if the images of the proposed townhouses had been changed since the last SPRC presentation. Mr. Stoddard replied they had not been.

Mr. Dudka said he agreed with the SPRC's comments that the townhouses had too much of an industrial feel. He suggested that white-colored window trim is desirable.

The Chairman stated the transition from the new multi-story building to the surrounding historic structures is not successful.

Mr. Craig asked if the presenters had considered reducing the light colors on the north elevation of the buildings along the new unnamed road to reduce glare. He also asked about the distance between the new townhouses and new high-rise building.

Mr. McClenan replied there will be approximately forty feet between the buildings, which would allow for space to plant trees. He also noted that the ground floor has been lowered.

Mr. Zink commented that the darker charcoal brick on the northern elevation seemed incongruous with the lighter red brick of the existing adjacent multi-family residences. The Chairman agreed. The applicants replied they would look into that.

Mr. Dudka asked if the board would see the project again.

Ms. Ballo said there would be at least one more SPRC meeting in the future; an additional presentation to the HALRB could be arranged.

Mr. Dudka said that this would be helpful.

Ms. Mariska stated that the applicant's next SPRC meeting would be January 8th with the final meeting on February 1st. She noted that the team could return to the January HALRB meeting.

The Chairman reiterated her remarks that the townhouse design does not work well with the surrounding buildings.

Mr. Liebertz noted that historic garden apartments differentiate their design with different entry detailing, roof forms, etc. He asked the board's opinion on the more homogeneous designs proposed by the applicant.

Ms. Steinberger said that it would be good to see more individuality in the applicant's designs.

Mr. Wenchel said the new townhouses should take their context into greater consideration. He added that there is not a compelling reason to have similar facades on these buildings as the townhouses on North Trenton Street.

Mr. Dudka asked if differentiating the pattern of the windows would help to break up the façade better and enable the brick to stand out more from the windows.

Mr. McClenan reminded the board that the fifth floor would be set back and given a stucco finish, which would provide more differentiation.

Mr. Arnold said that experimenting with a different design for the windows may be a good idea.

The Chairman called for additional comments.

Ms. Ballo said she had mentioned at the first SPRC meeting it would be helpful to see seeing some cuts through the site that could be added to page 17. She added that it is necessary to see how the new townhouses, driveways, and alterations to the landscape in the rear of the proposed townhouses is going to work vis-à-vis the Whitfield Commons buildings. There is a large grade change in the middle of the site, and sections should be provided to see if retaining walls or other hardscape features are going to be necessary. In addition, she stated that there need to be renderings provided of the townhouses from the interior of the Whitfield Commons site looking to the south and the southwest.

Mr. Laporte asked for more clarity on the applicant’s interest in historic preservation easements.

Ms. Mariska said they would like more consideration for bonus density in exchange for easements.

Mr. Craig asked if the bonus density would apply to the Arlington Boulevard elevation.

Ms. Mariska replied the density would apply to how the units were divided.

Ms. Ballo said negotiations were still underway on this issue. The County is requesting an historic preservation easement, but is not prepared to offer bonus density.

The Chairman thanked the applicant and asked them to confirm they could present at the January HALRB.

CHAIRMAN’S REPORT: ELECTION OF CHAIRMAN AND VICE-CHAIRMAN

The Chairman asked for nominations for the positions of Chair and Vice-Chair.

Mr. Dudka moved to nominate Joan Lawrence as Chair and Richard Woodruff as Vice-Chair. Mr. Laporte seconded the nomination. The nominations were confirmed on a vote of 7-0-0.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Survey: Site Plan/Development Review: Columbia Pike Form Base Code amendments; Market Common site plan

Ms. Ballo informed the board that the Columbia Pike Form Base Code amendments had been moved to the consent agenda for the upcoming County Board meeting. Ms. Ballo stated that the Market Common site plan was ready to go to Planning Commission and the County Board in January. She will send a

separate email asking for an HALRB rep at those meetings. Mr. Woodruff attended the board meeting where the affordable housing masterplan was discussed.

Survey: Staff and Other Reports: Zoning Ordinance Amendment; Housing Conservation District (HCD)

Ms. Steinberger notified the board that the World War I Task Force will resume meeting in January. The World War I movie series the Task Force sponsored at Central Library had been successful, and another series could be planned for a later time. The Task Force was working on obtaining permits to allow a mobile truck of World War I artifacts to be at next year's County Fair. Ms. Steinberger thanked staff for their help in completing a grant application to make interpretive signage for the Clarendon War Memorial.

Mr. Liebertz reminded the board that the next Maywood Design Guidelines Committee meeting would be the hour before the January 17, 2018, HALRB meeting.

He also updated the board on CoA 17-26 for 2301 North Kenmore Street, an after-the-fact request to install a metal shed. After consulting with County Zoning staff, Mr. Liebertz informed the applicant that they needed consult Zoning due to setback issues. The application has been indefinitely deferred.

Ms. Liccese-Torres informed the board that the hiring process to replace Marlene Terreros, retired Historic Preservation Specialist, continues.

The Chairman encouraged the board to continue to participate at meetings and events to represent the HALRB and the Historic Preservation Program.

Ms. Ballo encouraged members to attend SPRC meetings.

The meeting adjourned at 9:21 PM.