

Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board

Arlington County, Virginia

HALRB Case 17-22A (HP1700043)



An after-the-fact request by Asghar Shahmoradi & Maryam Amiryan, owner of 2337 North Fillmore Street in the Maywood Historic District, to replace the existing windows.

For DRC (*circle those present*): **Robert Dudka**, Charles Craig, **Andrew Wenchel**,
Tova Solo, Joan Lawrence, John Peck

For Arlington County (*circle those present*): Cynthia Liccese-Torres, **Rebecca Ballo**, John Liebertz

Case # 17-22 Agenda Item # 3

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Asghar Shahmoradi

For Applicant(s): Asghar Shahmoradi

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

1. No issues with the after-the-fact paving. Meets Design guidelines for hardscape requirements.
2. After-the-fact vinyl windows require broader policy discussion with HALRB. No recommendation.
3. Paving will be put on consent; windows put on discussion.

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda: Paving only.

Place on discussion agenda: Windows.

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

No recommendation.



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: HALRB
FROM: John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: September 13, 2017
SUBJECT: 2337 North Fillmore Street, Case 17-22A, Maywood Historic District

Background Information

The Split Level dwelling is located at 2337 North Fillmore Street and it is located in the Maywood Local Historic District. Built in 1960, the three-bay, side gabled dwelling is faced with stretcher bond brick coursing. Fenestration includes a recessed entryway featuring a four-panel, two-light wood door with three-light sidelights and one-over-one, vinyl-sash windows. The square bay window features a picture window consisting of a fixed single-light window flanked by one-over-one, double-hung windows. The roof is pierced by an interior brick chimney. The subject dwelling is not listed in the Maywood National Register Historic District and is considered a “post-historic period property” in the Maywood Local Historic District.

On June 13, 2017, the Historic Preservation Code Inspector noticed completed work on a brick paver pathway at the subject property (see CoA application 17-22). Upon review of the property file, the code inspector noticed that the wood 6/6 windows had been replaced with vinyl 1/1 windows at an unknown date. The inspector issued a notice of violation for both the brick paver pathway and the windows on July 13, 2017, and directed the owner to coordinate with HPP staff on a Certificate of Appropriateness application.

Prior to the window replacement, photographs from 2015 show the original six-over-six, double-hung, wood-sash windows on the two-story section of the dwelling. The picture window likely consisted of later replacement windows based on its appearance.

Proposal

The applicant requests an after-the-fact approval for the replacement of eleven windows with Simonton Reflection vinyl replacement windows. The windows were replaced by the applicant in July 2015.

DRC Review

The Design Review Committee (DRC) heard this application at its September 6, 2017, meeting. The committee had no comments on the application as it is a policy discussion for the entire board. The DRC requested that the item be placed on the discussion agenda for the September 20, 2017, HALRB hearing.

Staff Recommendation

The HPP staff recommends denial of the subject application. The *Maywood Design Guidelines* state:

Repair or replacement of windows with different materials, a different design and/or a different size, requires a Certificate of Appropriateness. Vinyl or aluminum (or vinyl- or aluminum-clad) windows are inappropriate to Maywood.

While the installation of the vinyl windows occurred two years prior to the notice of violation, there is no established statute of limitation regarding when a violation can be issued within local historic districts for work that fails to comply with the established guidelines. The HALRB should consider the exclusion of the picture window on the front elevation from a denial of the application since it appears that the original historic fabric had previously been removed.

Therefore, the HPP staff recommends denial of the subject proposal as it fails to comply with Chapter 5: Exterior Renovation of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*.



Figure 1: View of the front elevation of 2337 North Fillmore Street, 2015.



Figure 2: View of the front elevation of 2337 North Fillmore Street, 2017.