

Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board

Arlington County, Virginia

HALRB Case 17-19 (HP1700030)



A request by Keith & Georgia Peddie, owner of 3628 21st Avenue North in the Maywood Historic District, to alter the windows and door on the front elevation, construct a new side door, build a new porch, and replace the existing asphalt driveway..

For DRC (*circle those present*): **Robert Dudka, Charles Craig, Andrew Wenchel, Tova Solo, Joan Lawrence, John Peck**

For Arlington County (*circle those present*): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo, John Liebertz**

Case # 2 Agenda Item # 17-19

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Keith & Georgia Peddie

For Applicant(s): Heidi Fitzharris

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

DRC Recommendations:

1. Reconsider the use of board and batten.
 - a. Consensus of the committee is that the material's use on this house would be inappropriate.
 - b. If used, consider limiting its placement to the rear addition (not on the side addition/porch infill).
2. Gable returns
 - a. Study design and size of the gable returns on the original house.
 - b. Remove returns from the rear addition.
3. Front door
 - a. Revise the design of the front door.
 - i. Include traditional side lights.
4. Add third column to the infill porch.
5. No comments on the garage, but consider the addition of a window.
6. Need to see drawings for Phase One.

Staff Recommendations:

1. Please include drawings that will be part of Phase 1. While the DRC/HALRB can review Phase 2, the board must assume that Phase 1 will be the final product.
2. Overall design of the dwelling.
 - a. As a non-contributing resource (lacking a clear architectural style) to the Maywood Local Historic District, the original massing does not require the same level of deference given to historic dwellings.
 - i. The overall goal should be to create a cohesive dwelling that is complimentary and respects the Maywood Local Historic District. If desired, you could reexamine the design as there is likely greater latitude.
3. Materials
 - a. Vinyl is not permitted as a material within new construction per the Maywood Design Guidelines. The application is requesting various patching of old openings. Staff recommends that the elevations are refaced with an appropriate material (wood or cementitious fiberboard siding).
 - i. Consider including elevations that hatches all of the proposed patched locations on the front and side elevations.
 - b. Consider a different material than the board and batten.
 - i. This level of differentiation from the main massing is not needed.
4. North Elevation
 - a. All columns and porch flooring should be wood.
 - b. Revise the design of the front door to include traditional side lights.
 - c. Staff considers the double-leaf (French doors) to be inappropriate.
 - d. Include section of the front porch.

5. West Elevation

- a. Staff considers the double-leaf (French doors) to be inappropriate.
- b. Reconsider the use of the gable return on the addition.
- c. Study the design of the dormer.
- d. Include section of the screened porch.
- e. Reconsider design of gable vent.

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda

Place on discussion agenda:

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

No recommendation.

For DRC (circle those present): **Robert Dudka**, Charles Craig, **Andrew Wenchel**,
Tova Solo, Joan Lawrence, John Peck

For Arlington County (circle those present): Cynthia Liccese-Torres, **Rebecca Ballo**, John Liebertz

Case # 17-19 Agenda Item # 1

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Keith & Georgia Peddie

For Applicant(s): Heidi Fitzharris, Georgia Peddie

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

1. Include rail and porch sections.
2. A8 door more compatible option. Either meet Design Guidelines—include only one option in final submittal.
3. Show porch edge on A10.
4. Submit specifications for standing seam roof with the 1” crimp.
5. Columns and porch flooring to be wood.
6. Ok to patch vinyl as needed.
7. Staff will follow-up regarding pine tree in rear yard.
8. No comments on driveway.

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda:

Place on discussion agenda:

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

No recommendation.



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: HALRB
FROM: John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: September 13, 2017
SUBJECT: 3628 21st Avenue North, Case 17-19, Maywood Historic District

Background Information

The dwelling at 3628 21st Avenue North was rebuilt circa 1985. The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the house as follows:

The three-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling is clad in vinyl siding, and has a side-gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. The one-story, five-bay, shed-roof front porch has square posts. Windows are 1/1 vinyl-sash. Other notable features include simulated louvered shutters, projecting eaves, and a vinyl soffit and cornerboards. The house was completely rebuilt c. 1985.

The subject dwelling is listed as a non-contributing resource to the Maywood National Register Historic District.

Archival records and aerial photographs provide evidence that the original building underwent significant alterations in the mid-to-late twentieth century. Building permit records indicate a number of alterations to the original building: 1) reconstruction of the front porch (1950); 2) addition of a porch (1951); 3) construction of a dormer (1980); 4) 10' addition to the side of the house (1980); and 5) addition of a front stoop with no roof cover (1981). Additional permit records from the mid-1980s are no longer accessible. A 1987 survey of the neighborhood noted that the original house had a design similar to the bungalow located at 3616 21st Avenue North. For these reasons, Historic Preservation Program staff agree with the evaluation of this resource as a non-contributing building to the Maywood National Register Historic District.

Proposal

The applicant proposes the following alterations to the house:

1. North elevation (façade):
 - a. Demolition of the existing three-bay front porch.
 - b. Construction of a wrap-around front porch.
 - i. The porch has a pier foundation with orthogonal lattice. The hipped standing seam metal porch is supported by square wood columns with an AZEK base and capital.

- ii. Other details include wood tongue-and-groove flooring, wood hand rails and balusters
 - iii. Wood stair on the eastern end of the porch.
 - c. Fenestration
 - i. Removal of the existing windows and doors.
 - ii. Alteration to the location and size of the openings.
 - iii. New wood door and windows.
 - 1. Paneled, four-light, wood door with two-light sidelights.
 - 2. Single and paired single-light casement windows with one-over-one simulated divided light. Windows have AZEK casing and sills.
 - iv. Removal of the existing masonry chimney.
 - v. Replacement of the existing asphalt roof with an architectural asphalt shingle roof.
- 2. West elevation (side):
 - a. Fenestration
 - i. New double-leaf, four-light, wood doors that provide access to the wraparound porch.
 - ii. Wood stair to the wraparound front porch.
- 3. South elevation (side):
 - a. Replace door to rear patio with a two-panel, nine-light, wood Dutch door.
 - i. The entry way is protected by a small asphalt shingle shed roof supported by wood brackets.
- 4. Landscape
 - a. Alteration to the location and size of the asphalt driveway.

DRC Review

The Design Review Committee (DRC) heard this application at its August and September 2017 meetings. The scope of the project changed between the two meetings and numerous elements were omitted at the second hearing (including, but not limited to a rear addition). At the second meeting, the committee recommended the applicant select the option with the front door with sidelights on both sides instead of a single side, but noted that either option met the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. In addition, HPP staff and the DRC agreed that the limited scope of the proposed project would allow for the select patching of the vinyl siding in lieu of replacement with a material that meets the standards set forth in the *Design Guidelines*. The committee requested the applicant include numerous specifications or amend materials submitted. There were no comments about the driveway and this alteration was deemed compatible.

The DRC recommended that this application be placed on the consent agenda for the September 20, 2017, HALRB hearing.

Staff Recommendation

The HPP staff recommends approval of the application. The HALRB has allowed for the alteration of non-contributing resources within the local historic district contingent upon the compatibility of the proposal with the historic and architectural character of the local historic district. Non-contributing resources should respect and complement the scale, massing, fenestration patterns, and overall streetscape of the historically significant period; however, there are many building forms and designs that can complete this objective. Staff finds that the proposed design of the front elevation, including the wraparound porch, conforms to the criteria outlined in the *Maywood Design Guidelines*, as does the proposed alteration to the asphalt driveway. Therefore, the HPP staff finds that the proposal is appropriate



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

for the Maywood Historic District and complies with Chapter 5: Exterior Renovation and Chapter 7: Site Elements of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*.