



DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING, HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENT

Neighborhood Services Division

Courthouse Plaza One 2100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22201  
TEL 703.228.3830 FAX 703.228.3834 www.arlingtonva.us

*DRAFT*

## MINUTES OF THE HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD

**Wednesday, November 16, 2016  
2100 Clarendon Boulevard  
Lobby Rooms Cherry and Dogwood**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Charles Craig  
Gerry Laporte  
Joan Lawrence, Chairman  
Tova Solo  
Sara Steinberger  
Mark Turnbull  
Andrew Wenchel  
Richard Woodruff  
Mitchell Zink

**MEMBERS EXCUSED:** Robert Dudka  
Carmela Hamm  
Charles Matta, Vice Chairman  
John Peck  
Kevin Vincent

**STAFF:** Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Historic Preservation Coordinator  
Rebecca Ballo, Historic Preservation Planner  
John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner

### ROLL CALL & CALL TO ORDER

The Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:32 pm. Mr. Liebertz called the roll and determined there was a quorum.

### DEFERRAL OF THE OCTOBER 19, 2016 MEETING MINUTES

The Historic Preservation Program staff noted that the minutes for the October 19, 2016, HALRB meeting were not prepared due to technical issues. The HALRB will review the minutes at the December 21, 2016, HALRB meeting. Regarding the Robert Ball Sr. Family Burial Ground Local Historic District Designation portion of the hearing, the full public testimony will not be incorporated into the minutes but the audio file will be available if requested.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS (CoAs)**

The Chairman reviewed the public hearing procedures. She stated there were three items on the consent agenda. Item #1 on the consent agenda (CoA 16-16A) has been deferred at the request of the applicant. Mr. Laporte moved to approve Items #2, 3, and 4, on the consent agenda as submitted. Mr. Zink seconded the motion and it passed 8 to 0 (Ms. Steinberger had not yet arrived). The Chairman added that there was a single item on the discussion agenda and one ACoA. Mr. Liebertz briefly discussed the ACoA; there were no questions or comments.

**CONSENT AGENDA:**

1. Ginger Brown  
5151 14<sup>th</sup> Street North  
CoA 16-16A (HP1600041)  
Broadview Historic District  
Request to construct a shed with an attached greenhouse, install a trash enclosure, and other landscape alterations.
2. Razvan Cernucan (on behalf of Pershing Drive Associates & Ballston Park Apts.)  
200 North Piedmont Street  
CoA 16-27 (HP1600069)  
Buckingham Village Historic District  
Request to replace the existing playground equipment.
3. Hee Jin Chang on behalf of Ballston Retail, LLC  
237 North Glebe Road  
CoA 16-26 (HP1600068)  
Buckingham Village Historic District  
Request to install signage.
4. Scott Brideau & Carolyn Rickard-Brideau  
3210 23<sup>rd</sup> Street North  
CoA 14-06C (HP1600071)  
Maywood Historic District  
Request to amend CoA 14-06 in order to add a glass block window on the rear elevation.

**DISCUSSION AGENDA:**

1. Elizabeth Polis  
3603 22<sup>nd</sup> Street North  
CoA 16-25 (HP1600067)  
Maywood Historic District  
Request to replace the existing roofs.

**ADMINISTRATIVE COA(S):**

1. Jeffrey Dickey & Laura Chipkin  
3213 Old Dominion Drive  
ACoA 16-29 (HP1600066)  
Maywood Historic District  
Request to remove a 24-inch white oak tree.

**DISCUSSION AGENDA ITEM #1: CoA 16-25, 3603 22<sup>nd</sup> STREET NORTH**

The Chairman welcomed the applicants Elizabeth Polis and Thomas Michael Stroot. Ms. Polis presented their proposal to replace the entire roof (both the historic stamped tin shingle and later asphalt shingle sections) with a new architectural asphalt shingle roof. The applicants stated that they preferred to install tin shingles, but the costs made it infeasible. She added that they have reached out to neighbors to see if anyone would be interested in making a group purchase to lower costs, but received only one response. This family did not plan to move forward in the near future. In addition, Alpha Rain, who installed a number of roofs in Maywood, stated that purchasing tin shingles for multiple homes would no longer lower the price due to changes by the supplier. The applicants also inquired into other nearby homes slated for demolition, but they received no response from the property owner. Ms. Polis added that they called architectural salvage stores with no success. She stated that they explored refinishing the existing tin shingles, but the material is heavily damaged/rusted.

Mr. Liebertz stated that the DRC sent the item forward without a recommendation. The committee recognized the need to replace the existing tin shingles, but decided that their replacement with a different material fell outside of their scope of review as the request does not comply with the *Maywood Design Guidelines*.

Mr. Liebertz provided the staff report. Staff agreed that the deterioration of the stamped tin shingle roof is evident, but that the HALRB should continue its existing policy that original architectural materials be replaced in-kind with a like material. This conforms to both the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation* and the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. Since the *Maywood Design Guidelines* were revised and updated in 2006, there have been numerous tin roofs replaced in-kind and the material is still available. There have been no approved replacements of tin-shingle roofs with asphalt shingles during this time period.

Mr. Liebertz stated that staff would support the replacement of the existing three-tab asphalt shingle roof with an architectural asphalt shingle roof and the replacement of the existing tin shingle with a new metal shingle roof. At the DRC, Mr. Wenchel had suggested the installation of a curb to break the two materials. Staff would also support this option.

Ms. Polis stated that the roof has active leaks. She asked if the replacement of the tin shingle with standing seam metal would be an option. Mr. Craig stated that other historic districts besides Maywood require the in-kind replacement of stamped tin shingle. Historic districts that permit the replacement of the materials with asphalt shingle or standing seam metal quickly lose a character-defining feature of the historic district. Mr. Craig suggested other types of stamped metal shingles other than tin such as stamped aluminum.

Ms. Ballo stated that staff has approved the replacement of stamped tin shingles with stamped metal shingles (other than tin). The important component of the design is the stamp in the metal shingle.

Mr. Woodruff asked if the HALRB ever approved the replacement of stamped tin shingle with a different material. Mr. Liebertz replied that it occurred at least one time before the update to the *Maywood Design Guidelines* in 2006. Ms. Ballo added that before 2006, the emphasis on preserving original architectural materials was less. In 2006, the neighborhood made a conscious decision to emphasize the preservation of original architectural materials. Since this time, all the roofs have been replaced in-kind. It should not be assumed, however, that owners within the historic district did not replace tin shingle roofs in-kind before 2006.

The HALRB discussed the cost estimates submitted by the applicants and the different options presented in the application. These options included an asphalt shingle roof and a stamped tin shingle roof. There were no options presented for replacing the stamped tin shingle in-kind and the asphalt shingle in-kind since the applicants preferred to install a single material.

Mr. Wenchel remarked that the problem with the existing roof is the junction between the existing tin roof and the asphalt roof that are on the same plane. He suggested the installation of a curb to separate the materials or the installation of a single material. Mr. Wenchel added, however, that the curb would be visible from the public rights-of-way. Breaking the material with a curb would further distinguish the addition from the original house. Mr. Liebertz stated that staff was supportive of that solution. The owner, however, stated that he submitted the application to have the HALRB vote upon the use of asphalt shingle.

Ms. Ballo briefly discussed the potential for the applicants to apply for historic preservation tax credits from the state. She added that the County's Zoning Ordinance and the *Maywood Design Guidelines* do not speak to cost. The HALRB is not empowered to make a decision based on cost, but only on the architectural appropriateness as noted in the *Maywood Design Guidelines* and the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*. Ms. Steinberger confirmed that utilizing a different metal other than tin would be appropriate for stamped shingle.

Ms. Solo suggested that the staff or HALRB write a letter to Dittmar requesting salvaged materials from the two Maywood homes (just outside of the local historic district) slated for demolition.

The Chairman made the following motion:

The HALRB approves the installation of a structure [curb] separating the historic roof from the new addition, and replacing the metal roof with metal and the asphalt shingle roof with an architectural asphalt shingle roof.

Alternatively, the HALRB approves the replacement of the entire roof with metal.

Mr. Laporte asked if standing seam metal would be an appropriate material per the motion. The Chairman clarified her motion to include the language "metal shingles" in lieu of "metal." Mr. Craig further amended the motion to read, "pressed or stamped metal shingles." The Chairman accepted the amendment. Mr. Liebertz suggested that the applicants return to the DRC to review Option 1 (installation of the curb) to ensure the division is appropriate. Mr. Craig seconded the motion. The Chairman opened the motion for further discussion.

Ms. Solo asked if the front slope of the hipped roof could be stamped tin shingle and the remaining house be asphalt shingle. Mr. Wenchel stated that the flashing on the ridge of the hipped roof could be hidden. The board discussed this option further.

Mr. Liebertz added that the HALRB should consider consistency when discussing the potential options. Owners in Maywood have been replacing these types of roofs in-kind for the last ten years. The staff and the board discussed projects that have had stamped tin shingle roofs replaced in-kind. The Chairman stated that she would not support the installation of tin shingles only on the front slope of the roof.

The Chairman reread the amended motion:

The HALRB approves the installation of a structure [curb] separating the historic roof from the new addition, and replacement of the existing stamped/pressed metal shingle roof with a new stamped/pressed metal shingle roof and the existing asphalt shingle roof with an architectural asphalt shingle roof.

Alternatively, the HALRB approves the replacement of the entire roof with a pressed/stamped metal shingle roof.

The motion passed 6-2-1 (Mr. Woodruff and Ms. Solo voted against the motion; Mr. Turnbull abstained).

### **HISTORIC MARKER: HALL'S HILL WALL**

The Chairman welcomed representatives from the Hall's Hill/High View Park Historic Preservation Coalition. Ms. Liccese-Torres introduced the project and discussed the request to install a cast-aluminum marker noting the history of the segregation wall. Diane Hamm, Sandra Green, Willie Jackson, and Tia Alfred represented the coalition and spoke about the proposed language. The HALRB reviewed and commented on the numerous iterations of the markers. The HALRB moved to approve the concept and directed staff to work with the representatives on the final language. The motion passed 8-0-1 (Ms. Steinberger abstained).

### **HISTORIC MARKERS: CALLOWAY CEMETERY**

The Chairman welcomed representatives from Calloway United Methodist Church and Cemetery. Ms. Liccese-Torres introduced Jill Yutan, Arlington County Neighborhood Conservation Program, Katherine Leonard, principal of FasterKitty, and representatives of the church. Ms. Liccese-Torres outlined the proposed cemetery beautification project, including the installation of two historic markers. Ms. Leonard discussed the proposed materials of the markers and their location. She described the content of the two panels that would be mounted on a single pole. The HALRB reviewed and commented on the markers. The HALRB moved to approve the concept and directed staff to work with Ms. Leonard on the final language. The motion passed unanimously.

### **HISTORIC MARKERS: JENNIE DEAN PARK**

The Chairman welcomed Katherine Leonard, principal of FasterKitty, who designed the two historic markers. Ms. Liccese-Torres outlined the project. The HALRB reviewed and commented on the proposed content of the markers. The HALRB moved to approve the concept and directed staff to work with Ms. Leonard on the final language. The motion passed unanimously.

**HISTORIC MARKERS: BLUE GOOSE**

The Chairman welcomed Megan Pierce from the Shooshan Company, who authored the proposed historic markers. She explained there would be nine new historic markers on the site. The Chairman asked Mr. Bernard Berne to provide public comment. He requested the following items: 1) that the table-top marker include additional language about the transportation history of the site; 2) a marker include a photograph of the Lacey Rail Yard from the King Collection; 3) a marker include a map showing the route of the WA&FC streetcar line; 4) correction of inaccurate text and photographs on the four transportation markers; and 5) removal of the two markers relating to the history of Ballston and the Ballston Metro as they fail to comply to the site plan condition.

Mr. Liebertz reviewed the proposed content of each marker with the HALRB, who requested numerous revisions. The Chairman moved to approve the proposed markers in concept with the following comments: 1) the applicant utilize the table-top marker text written by staff; 2) the applicant take the information presented in the “History of Ballston” marker and integrate it into the other markers; and 3) the applicant use the alternative marker showing the aerial photograph of Clarendon and Ballston. The HALRB directed staff to work with the applicant on the final language. The motion passed unanimously.

**REPORTS OF CHAIRMAN, STAFF AND STANDING COMMITTEES:**

The Chairman reminded the members about the logistics of the upcoming Westover Historic District public hearing to be held at Swanson Middle School on November 30, 2016.

The Chairman provided a brief update on the Robert Ball Sr. Family Burial Ground. The County Board will hear the local historic district designation request concurrently with the site plan application. Ms. Ballo stated that the earliest date for the hearing would be February 2017. The Chairman added that the County Board members largely supported the designation of the burial ground. Ms. Ballo stated that the Site Plan Review Committee process for the site plan would begin (tentatively) in December 2016.

The Chairman requested members to volunteer for the nominating committee to select HALRB officers for 2017. The board selected Robert Dudka, Charles Matta, and Dick Woodruff to serve on the committee.

The meeting adjourned at 10:41 pm.