



DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING, HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENT

Neighborhood Services Division

Courthouse Plaza One 2100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22201
TEL 703.228.3830 FAX 703.228.3834 www.arlingtonva.us

DRAFT

MINUTES OF THE HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD

**Wednesday, June 15, 2016
2100 Clarendon Boulevard
Lobby Rooms Cherry and Dogwood**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Charles Craig
Robert Dudka
Gerry Laporte
Charles Matta, Vice Chairman
John Peck
Tova Solo
Sara Steinberg
Andrew Wenchel
Mitchell Zink

MEMBERS EXCUSED: Carmela Hamm
Joan Lawrence, Chairman
Mark Turnbull
Kevin Vincent
Richard Woodruff

STAFF: Rebecca Ballo, Historic Preservation Planner
John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner

ROLL CALL & CALL TO ORDER

The Vice Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:33 pm. Mr. Liebertz called the roll and determined there was a quorum.

APPROVAL OF MAY 18, 2016 MEETING MINUTES

The Vice Chairman asked for any changes or corrections to the May 18, 2016, meeting minutes. Mr. Craig moved to approve the draft meeting minutes as submitted. Mr. Wenchel seconded the motion and it passed 8-0-1 (Ms. Steinberg had not yet arrived; Mr. Dudka abstained).

PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS (CoAs)

The Vice Chairman reviewed the public hearing procedures regarding speaker slips. He stated there were three items on the consent agenda. Items #2 was pulled due to public comment. The Vice Chairman called for a motion on Items #1 and 3 of the consent agenda. Ms. Solo moved to approve these consent agenda items and Mr. Laporte seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (10-0).

CONSENT AGENDA:

1. Francisco Hernandez
3316 21st Avenue North
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 16-04A (HP1600032)
Request to amend CoA 16-04 for the following items: 1) that the HALRB direct the Zoning Administrator to grant a side yard setback modification; and 2) to clarify the width of the eaves on the side addition's hipped-roof

2. Glen & Brooke Vogel (Removed for discussion)
3624 21st Avenue North
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 16-13 (HP1600033)
Request to install a red brick driveway, new steps to the front porch, flagstone paver stepping stones from the driveway to the back patio, and increase the footprint of the rear flagstone patio.

3. David & Maria Greene
2204 North Kenmore Street
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 15-17B (HP1600034)
Request to construct four timber window wells and relocate a/c units if necessary.

PULLED CONSENT AGENDA ITEM #2:

The Chairman asked Mr. Vogel, the applicant, to introduce the project. Mr. Vogel briefly outlined the scope of the project (modifying the front porch, stair, and landscape alterations). He agreed to address any concerns presented by his neighbors. Mr. Matta asked if there was any response to the neighbor's concern regarding stormwater runoff. Ms. FitzHarris, the project architect, stated that the applicant coordinated with DES to tap into a drainpipe to alleviate water issues moving forward.

Mr. Dudka stated that the DRC had no comments on the application. The committee did not discuss stormwater management and advised that it is not an HALRB issue. Mr. Liebertz stated that staff recommended approval of the application as it meets the *Maywood Design Guidelines*.

Ms. Solo moved to approve the application as submitted and to contact the property owner regarding the applicant's coordination with DES. Mr. Craig seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

ADMINISTRATIVE COA(S)

1. F. Misilo
1801 Queens Lane, #135
Colonial Village Historic District
ACoA 16-10 (HP1600025)
Request to replace five windows.
2. Pershing Drive Associates Limited Partnership
351 North Glebe Road
Buckingham Historic District
ACoA 16-11 (HP1600027)
Request to remove a 38-inch Siberian Elm tree.
3. Carter & Christi Hamm
2915 22nd Street North
Maywood Historic District
ACoA 16-12 (HP1600028)
Request to remove a 32-inch White Oak tree.
4. Ann & Henry Kelly
2210 North Nelson Street
Maywood Historic District
ACoA 16-13 (HP1600029)
Request to remove a 30-inch Tulip tree.
5. Arlington County
2133 North Taft Street
Dawson Terrace Historic District
ACoA 16-15 (HP1600031)
Request to remove a 37-inch Red Oak tree.
6. Ryan Bennett
2807 Arlington Boulevard, #101
Cambridge Courts Historic District
ACoA 16-16 (HP1600035)
Request to replace nine windows.

Mr. Liebertz presented the administrative CoAs approved by HPP staff in the last month. He noted that the majority of the CoAs were for tree removals that were reviewed and approved by the County Forester. Mr. Liebertz added that the Colonial Village ACoA utilized the approved Paradigm Single-Hung Hybrid Window. In addition, the the first request at Cambridge Courts Historic District was submitted and approved.

DISCUSSION ITEM #1: 2102 NORTH IRVING STREET, COA 16-06

1. Diane & Hugh Schratwieser
2102 North Irving Street
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 16-06 (HP1600017)
Request to demolish an existing garage.

The Vice Chairman welcomed the applicants, Diane and Hugh Schratwieser, owners of 2102 North Irving Street. Ms. Schratwieser provided the history of the garage, including discussion of previous submissions for its replacement to the HALRB. She stated that the house was constructed ca. 1912. When they purchased the house, there was an 8-year old oak tree in front of the garage. After the removal of the tree, the family utilized it for bicycles and other storage items. She noted that the staff report stated that the oak tree “had begun to” heave the blocks; she contested that it is a long-standing condition. Ms. Schratwieser added that the existing oak tree next to the garage is at least 200 years old. The tree predated the construction of the existing garage. She discussed the garage’s lack of a foundation, problems with the adjacent tree, and a previous proposal to relocate the garage to a new location on site.

Ms. Schratwieser described the 2011 design review process and eventual impasse with the HALRB. For these reasons, the family is requesting the demolition of the garage. The application does not include the construction of a new garage. She listed a number of recent improvements completed on the dwelling. Ms. Schratwieser asked for the HALRB to dismiss discussion of any restrictions or construction regarding the design of a future garage. They [the owners] will not accept any conditions or encumbrance on the property. She suggested that outbuildings be dismissed entirely from the review process.

Ms. Schratwieser added that the Cherrydale blocks will be made available to the community.

Mr. Dudka stated that the DRC heard the application twice. At the first hearing, the DRC attached some restrictions on a future garage. The applicants, who were not present at the first meeting, objected to any restrictions at the second hearing. The DRC discussed the legality of placing such restrictions on a property, but recognized that the board would simply be encumbering themselves in future design review cases. The DRC had no recommendation on the application.

Mr. Liebertz provided the HPP staff report and summarized the background information on the dwelling, garage, and tree. Staff had no recommendation on the application. He stated that the HALRB will need to consider and weigh the various factors of the case, including the 1) historic integrity and structural stability of the garage; 2) the protection of the tree; 3) the precedent for demolishing a contributing resource; and 4) the interest of public health and safety.

The Vice Chairman opened the discussion to the HALRB. Mr. Laporte asked about the recycling of the Cherrydale block. Ms. Ballo responded that there are a number of organizations such as Habitat for Humanity and the ReStore that will salvage the block. HPP staff will facilitate the salvage of materials if the owners are unable to find a local owner to take the block. Mr. Laporte suggested retaining the block, even by the HALRB as private owners.

Ms. Solo, as a resident of Maywood, complimented the Schratwiesers on the rehabilitation of the home. The owners have a great deal of historical appreciation. She moved to approve demolition. The Vice Chairman asked Ms. Solo to hold the motion in order to allow for further comments by the board.

Ms. Steinberg thanked the owners for salvaging the blocks. She noted that safety is her primary concern and paramount consideration in this case.

Mr. Dudka shared concerns about the establishment of precedent. The HALRB needs to distinguish why the demolition of this particular contributing resource (i.e. the public health and safety concerns) is justified and can't be applied to outbuildings throughout the historic district. He recommended against any conditions on future garage designs. He hoped, however, that staff would inform the HALRB of this structure in any future application.

Ms. Solo asked HPP staff where prohibitions of demolitions are mentioned in the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. Mr. Liebertz responded that a chapter of the design guidelines discusses the demolition of historic buildings. The local ordinance and design guidelines strive to protect historic resources in the neighborhood. There are sections of the design guidelines that state historic materials should be maintained and repaired, etc. Ms. Ballo responded that the intent of the Maywood Local Historic District ordinance is to preserve and protect historic resources.

Ms. Steinberg agreed that the HALRB needs to ensure that there are no precedent setting motions. The motion should make it clear that since there is no safe and structural way to fix the garage (without harming the 200-year old tree) that the demolition be approved is approved due to public health and safety. Mr. Schratwieser listed structural issues with the dwelling that have existed since 1984.

Ms. Solo had concerns about discussing the removal of the garage due to the location of the tree and overall safety concerns. Ms. Steinberg responded that she is suggesting the board consider demolition due to the public health and safety concerns and the potential damage to the adjacent 200-year old tree. Ms. Solo asked if she would approve the demolition if the tree was not located adjacent to the garage. Ms. Steinberg added that this is not the situation before the HALRB. Ms. Solo contended that adding such language will make for a wider interpretation of the board's actions. Ms. Steinberg disagreed and recommended tailoring the motion for demolition with specific reference to the tree and public health and safety.

Mr. Craig concurred with Ms. Steinberg in that the motion focuses only on this structure, on this piece of property, being destroyed by the tree.

Mr. Wenchel agreed that this is a unique situation. The structure is in process of falling apart and is endangering a tree that is significantly older than the structure. There is little to be done to save the garage. Therefore, demolition is advisable as the building is a public safety hazard. The roof will soon collapse into the structure and someone could be injured. This is not a precedent setting case for demolition of a contributing building.

Mr. Zink and Mr. Peck concurred that the building is a public safety issue and recommended demolition.

The Vice Chairman returned to Ms. Solo's original motion that the HALRB approve the demolition of the garage. He asked Ms. Solo if she accepted Ms. Steinberg's and Mr. Dudka's amendments to the motion adding language regarding the 200-year old tree and public health and safety. Ms. Solo dismissed the amendments and presented her original motion that the "HALRB grant the demolition of the garage." Mr. Matta recommended a more detailed motion.

Mr. Dudka suggested that the motion include: 1) public health and safety aspects; 2) repair of the building would imperil the 200-year old tree (a protected resource); and 3) the design and poor construction of the garage does not lend itself to be repaired. Ms. Solo stated that if the HALRB fails to allow for the demolition of the garage that the board could be held liable for any potential injuries.

Mr. Matta offered Ms. Solo an opportunity to utilize the language outlined by Mr. Dudka in her motion. Ms. Solo asked what language the HALRB used when they gave permission to demolish the house on Fillmore Street. Mr. Liebertz responded that the HALRB did not issue a Certificate of Appropriateness regarding the demolition of the house on Fillmore Street. The straw poll suggested support that the site could be left open, developed as a home, etc., and that any proposal had to be approved in concert with the approval for demolition. If approved by the HALRB, the demolition will be contingent upon an acceptable new design. Mr. Matta asked the HALRB to keep the focus on this particular case. Ms. Solo rejected the amendments and moved to approve the demolition as requested by the applicant. The motion was not seconded; the motion failed and Mr. Matta called for a new motion.

Ms. Steinberg moved that the HALRB approve the demolition of the contributing garage due to the following: 1) public health and safety issues; 2) the difficulties in repairing the garage due to its design and construction; and 3) that any repair will likely result in harm to the 200-year old tree (a protected resource). Mr. Laporte recommended utilizing the language from the design guidelines, specifically “that it is the policy of the HALRB to maintain historic buildings on their original sites.” Ms. Steinberg agreed and amended the motion as follows: that the HALRB approve the demolition of the contributing garage due to the following: 1) public health and safety issues; 2) that the garage can’t be maintained on its original site; and 3) that any repair will result in harm to the 200-year old tree (a protected resource). Mr. Craig seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

WORLD WAR ONE CENTENNIAL COMMISSION

The Vice Chairman welcomed Edwin Fountain, Commissioner of the World War One Centennial Commission, and Dr. Alison Finkelstein. Mr. Fountain discussed the overall purpose of the national commission and that he is here to encourage that the HALRB and Arlington County take an active role in the commemoration of the centennial of World War One. Mr. Fountain stated that he is a resident of Arlington County; and therefore, he is particularly interested in Arlington County’s participation.

Mr. Fountain provided a brief history of World War One and the impact that the war had on all parts of American society. Arlington County had doubled its population in 1910 and 1920 due to the expansion of the Federal city. He noted that Arlington County World War One Memorial in Clarendon on Wilson Boulevard. He added that many residents do not know that it exists or fail to correlate the monument to World War One. Mr. Fountain summarized that approximately 16 Arlingtonians died in the War. There are many stories to be told regarding the County’s history and World War One. Mr. Fountain stated that he reached out to a number of other organizations (Arlington Historical Society, Arlington Public Schools, etc.). He suggested that a member of the HALRB send a representative to one of the state commissions meetings. Mr. Fountain outlined a number of planned events.

Mr. Fountain asked that the HALRB consider the following items: 1) an active leadership role for the County’s commemoration of the war; 2) promote the extensive number of educational resources prepared by the commission to APS; 3) suggest County-sponsored events; 4) advocate for the County taking an active role in the yearly commemoration at the monument in Clarendon completed by the American Legion; 5) the County participate in restoration of the plaque on the Clarendon World War One Memorial; and 6) participate with Arlington Public Schools to development programming over the next two years. Every stakeholder will approach commemoration in different means, but government involvement may entice private groups to participate.

Mr. Wenchel stated that the World War One Memorial in Clarendon is not well seen because of how the County treats the site. He referenced the police car/taxi anti-drinking and driving campaign and suggested the car be located to another site. Mr. Fountain congratulated the County for maintaining the grounds, but

recognized the problem with the police car/taxi. He believes that they can move the car without impinging on the public safety campaign.

Ms. Ballo added that the plaque and the memorial are owned by the American Legion. The County owns the rights-of-way and the park surrounding it, but maintenance of the memorial is completed by the American Legion. Mr. Laporte stated that redesign of the five-point intersection is underway. Mr. Craig asked if the improvements are part of the Clarendon Sector Plan. He suggested that the war memorial is lighted at night. Ms. Steinberg suggested moving the police car/taxi for the time of the commemoration.

Ms. Ballo stated that the County Board appointed a Commission to handle the commemoration of similar events including the 400-year anniversary of the Jamestown Settlement and the Civil War Sesquicentennial. The committees prioritized particular issues. She suggested that the HALRB could request that the County Board establish such a committee for the commemoration of World War One.

Dr. Alison Finkelstein, historian with the Department of Homeland Security, provided her background regarding the study of World War One memorials. She provided the history of commemoration of World War One following the war. The Clarendon War Memorial is an excellent representation of a local effort to commemorate the war. She recommended interpretation of the existing memorial with interpretive plaques. These plaques could address the segregated plaque. Scholars recommend interpretation of these plaque rather than removal of segregated plaques. Dr. Finkelstein discussed World War One “memory” within Arlington County (i.e. Fort Myer, Arlington National Cemetery, etc.). The first hurdle is to get the public to actively care about World War One.

Mr. Peck discussed War Memorial Stadium at Washington-Lee High School. He recommended involvement of the public schools as the largest memorial is located at the high school. Mr. Peck added that the missing World War II should be restored at the high school based on historic photographs/memory.

Ms. Steinberg suggested partnering with Arlington Independent Media for local high school students to produce a short documentary regarding Arlington County and World War One. Ms. Solo recommended the creation of a mobile application for wireless devices.

The Vice Chairman thanked the representatives for raising awareness to the HALRB. He added that the HALRB will urge members to actively participate in the commemoration process and recommend improvement of visibility of the monument. Mr. Laporte added that it would be appropriate for the HALRB to write a letter to the County Board to urge commemoration of the centennial. The Vice Chair agreed and requested that Mr. Laporte draft the letter.

REPORTS OF CHAIRMAN, STAFF AND STANDING COMMITTEES

The Vice Chairman welcomed County Board Member John Vihstadt who briefed the HALRB about Westover. He discussed affordable housing, historic preservation, and other developments.

The Vice Chairman and members of the HALRB requested that Department of Transportation provide a presentation regarding the intersection in Clarendon where the war memorial is located. Ms. Ballo stated that she will request a presentation by DES staff this summer.

The Vice Chairman asked for volunteers to represent the HALRB at upcoming planning studies. Ms. Solo requested to be representative for Westover meetings. She recommended that Carmella Hamm be nominated to represent the HALRB for the Lee Highway Planning Study. Mr. Peck also volunteered to

assist with any actions relating to Lee Highway. The Vice-Chairman requested that a HALRB member consider a second volunteer for Westover.

The Vice Chairman asked for a representative for the Four Mile Run Planning Study. Mr. Liebertz stated that an architectural survey of the study area will be undertaken to better understand the resources within the study area. The Vice Chairman stated that a request for volunteer will be addressed at the July 2016 HALRB hearing.

Mr. Liebertz provided an update regarding the Mt. Salvation Baptist Cemetery Local Historic District designation. He stated that a University of Mary Washington student is completing field documentation and a survey. Staff will be studying the genealogy and development of the cemetery in the Fall 2016.

Ms. Ballo outlined the schedule for the Stratford Local Historic District Designation hearing at the County Board. She requested that HALRB members attend the meeting to show their support of the local historic district designation.

Ms. Ballo asked the HALRB members who attended the training provided by the Virginia Department of Historic Resources (VDHR) to discuss the experience. Members found the training useful, but asked staff contact the state to distribute the PowerPoint presented at the meeting by VDHR..

The meeting adjourned at 9:47 PM.