



DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING, HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENT

Neighborhood Services Division

Courthouse Plaza One 2100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22201
TEL 703.228.3830 FAX 703.228.3834 www.arlingtonva.us

DRAFT

MINUTES OF THE HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD

**Wednesday, May 18, 2016
2100 Clarendon Boulevard
Lobby Rooms Cherry and Dogwood**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Charles Craig
Carmela Hamm
Gerry Laporte
Joan Lawrence, Chairman
Charles Matta, Vice Chairman
John Peck
Tova Solo
Sara Steinberg
Mark Turnbull
Andrew Wenchel
Richard Woodruff
Mitchell Zink

MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Robert Dudka
Greg Holcomb
Kevin Vincent

STAFF:

Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Historic Preservation Coordinator
Rebecca Ballo, Historic Preservation Planner
John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner

ROLL CALL & CALL TO ORDER

The Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:32 pm. Mr. Liebertz called the roll and determined there was a quorum.

APPROVAL OF APRIL 20, 2016 MEETING MINUTES

The Chairman asked for any changes or corrections to the April 20, 2016, meeting minutes. Mr. Matta moved to approve the draft meeting minutes as submitted. Mr. Woodruff seconded the motion and it passed 10-0-1 (Mr. Turnbull abstained).

NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION MONTH PROCLAMATION

The Chairman announced that May is National Historic Preservation Month. She shared the official resolution that was read at the County Board hearing on May 17, 2016.

PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS (CoAs)

The Chairman reviewed the public hearing procedures regarding speaker slips. She stated there were six items on the consent agenda. Items #1 and #5 were pulled from the consent agenda. The Chairman called for a motion on Items #2, 3, 4, and 6 of the consent agenda. Mr. Laporte moved to approve these items and Mr. Turnbull seconded. The motion passed unanimously (11-0; Ms. Hamm had not yet arrived).

CONSENT AGENDA:

- 1) Francisco Hernandez
3316 21st Avenue North
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 16-04 (HP1600012)
Request to build a second story on an existing side addition.
- 2) Amanda & Brian Davis
2165 North Lincoln Street
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 16-07 (HP1600018)
Request to remove the existing brick walkway and replace it with a Pennsylvania fieldstone walkway.
- 3) Theodore & Rebecca Schmitt
2315 North Kenmore Street
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 14-30B (HP1600020)
Request to amend CoA 14-30 in order to install a 9'x15' flagstone patio in the rear yard.
- 4) Melissa & Michael Paul
2911 22nd Street North
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 16-08 (HP1600019)
Request to construct a 12'x16' shed in the northwest corner (rear) of the property and install kitchen and bathroom vents on the side elevation.
- 5) Cameron Saadat
1005 South Quinn Street
Harry W. Gray House Historic District
HALRB Case 16-12 (HP1600024)
Request to install a handrail on an existing stoop.

- 6) Carter & Christi Ham
2915 22nd Street North
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 16-09 (HP1600021)
Request to renovate the existing screen porch into a sunroom.

PULLED CONSENT AGENDA ITEM #1: 3316 21ST AVENUE NORTH, COA 16-04

The Chairman asked staff to introduce the project. Mr. Liebertz stated the house at 3316 21st Avenue North is a contributing Queen Anne-inspired dwelling within the Maywood Historic District that was constructed ca. 1915. The project calls for a second-story addition to an existing one-story addition on the side of the dwelling. Mr. Liebertz called the HALRB's attention to the massing study in the staff report. He added that the DRC and staff evaluated two different roof forms for the second story addition, but agreed that the design of a hip roof was more appropriate to the historic dwelling. Staff discussed the project with the Zoning office after the DRC meeting and confirmed that the applicant can build a second story without receiving a setback modification for the side yard. The current one-story addition is sited 2.1' from the property line. A setback modification, however, is required for the proposed 1' roof overhang/eave as it extends beyond the face of the existing building wall. Therefore, the HALRB will be asked to grant a setback modification at the June HALRB meeting. Staff recommended the HALRB conditionally approve the design as submitted with the understanding that the applicant will return to ask the HALRB for a setback modification. Mr. Liebertz stated that since the setback modification was not publicly advertised, it cannot be considered as part of this approval.

Mr. Liebertz directed the HALRB's attention to a letter from John Doyon, the neighbor at 3400 21st Avenue North, who objected to the proposed design. He cited the health of the tree on their shared property line and appropriateness of building an addition on the one-story side addition as it will affect sunlight into his dwelling.

The Chairman stated that this request will come under the typical variance request in which the HALRB can direct the Zoning Administrator to grant a setback modification if the project is consistent with the existing streetscape and complies with the *Maywood Design Guidelines*.

Mr. Craig provided the DRC report. He discussed the form of the side addition, particularly the use of a gable or a hip roof facing the neighbor. Mr. Craig added that requesting a setback on the second-story addition would be inappropriate to the historic house. Therefore, it was placed on the consent agenda.

Mr. Liebertz made a correction to his previous statement. He previously stated that the roof overhang/eave on the addition was 1'; the proposal has a 2' overhang/eave to match the historic house. He recommended that this element be amended to 1' for the following reasons: 1) to ensure the roof overhang does not encroach on the neighbor's property line; and 2) to further distinguish the second-story addition from the historic house.

The Chairman asked how the side addition will impact the tree. Mr. Hernandez replied that a number of branches will be cut or trimmed to make room for the addition, but that the tree will not suffer. The Chairman asked about the location of the tree. Mr. Hernandez said the tree is located on the neighbor's property, but extends to his property.

Mr. Woodruff asked about the HALRB's zoning authority and what the Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA) does when a neighbor complains about a project that requires a setback modification. Ms. Ballo stated that the BZA hears public testimony and will make a decision based on the ordinance and hardship

criteria. The process is similar to a CoA process. Mr. Laporte stated that the decision is ultimately at the discretion of the BZA.

Ms. Solo asked if the public notification process should be amended to inform the neighbor of the proposed addition at an earlier date. The Chairman stated that the DRC does not hear public testimony. Mr. Liebertz added that as part of the CoA application, there is a requirement for neighbors to be informed of proposed plans. One of the issues in this case is that Mr. Doyon only recently purchased the adjacent property. Ms. Ballo added that the DRC agenda is distributed to the President of the Maywood Civic Association each month.

The Chairman called for a motion. Mr. Craig moved that the HALRB defer the item to the June HALRB hearing. Mr. Liebertz responded that the applicant hoped to receive a conditional approval (with the suggested amendment to the roof overhang from 2' to 1') so he can move forward with the permitting process. He would then return to DRC and HALRB in June with the updated plans for the roof overhang and request that the HALRB direct the Zoning Administrator to grant a setback modification. Mr. Craig amended his motion so that:

The HALRB accept his design as submitted noting that there will be modification to the roof overhang on the second-story side addition and that the item will return to the DRC and HALRB in June for review of the roof and setback modification request.

Mr. Wenchel seconded the motion. Mr. Laporte asked if the letter should specify that the HALRB recommend a 1' or 1.5' roof overhang. Mr. Craig stated that the overhang will be evaluated at DRC. Mr. Matta suggested that the motion be amended so that the current overhang will not exceed the current overhang on the existing one-story addition. Mr. Wenchel reviewed a number of the DRC's recommendations and complimented the applicant towards meeting the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. Mr. Craig discussed how the use of a gable roof and hipped roof on the second story would affect the proposed application. The motion passed unanimously 11-0.

PULLED CONSENT AGENDA ITEM #5: 1005 SOUTH QUINN STREET, COA 16-12

The Chairman asked staff to introduce the project. Ms. Ballo summarized the scope of the project noting that metal handrails will be added to a brick stoop/stair in the rear yard. The handrail will be attached to the stair at the mortar joints and not through the brick. Staff recommends approval of the application. Mr. Laporte stated that he pulled the item due to a typo on the cover sheet that identifies the house within the Dawson Terrace Historic District instead of the Harry W. Gray Historic District. The mistake was noted. The Chairman called for a motion. Mr. Woodruff moved to approve the item as corrected. Mr. Laporte seconded the motion and it passed unanimously 11-0.

ADMINISTRATIVE CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 1) Theresa M. Wyatt & Andrew Lewis
2313 North Jackson Street
Maywood Historic District
ACoA Case 16-06 (HP1600016)
Request to remove 47-inch Red Maple tree.

- 2) Cambridge Courts Condominium Association
2401-2813 Arlington Boulevard
Cambridge Courts Historic District

ACoA Case 16-08 (HP1600022)
Request to remove a 17-inch Red Maple tree.

- 3) Michael & Cheryl Olive
2910 23rd Street North
Maywood Historic District
ACoA Case 16-07 (HP1600026)
Request to install a wood privacy fence and gates on the side yard.

Regarding ACoA 16-06, Mr. Woodruff asked staff to discuss the size of the tree regarding whether it is 47” in diameter or circumference. Ms. Ballo stated that the tree is measured by its circumference. Mr. Liebertz stated that the tree is being removed due to basal decay, carpenter ants, and a large wound; there is a potential for it to fall on the public right-of-way and to damage power lines. Mr. Liebertz is unaware if the tree has been removed at this point.

PRESENTATION: ARLINGTON FORTS VIDEO

The Chairman welcomed Nathan Bynum (Arlington Independent Media, also known as AIM) and Nikolai Karamyshev (student intern). Ms. Liccese-Torres introduced the collaboration between the County’s Historic Preservation Program and AIM in the goal of engaging local students/youth in different county activities. An initiative called “Documenting Historic Arlington” was developed with Mr. Bynum, who created the instruction, scope, and overall goal of the project. The intention of the program is to create documentaries from a youth perspective that could be utilized in classrooms. He introduced Nikolai Karamyshev (one of the three student creators of the documentary) who is a junior at H-B Woodlawn. Mr. Karamyshev noted his colleagues, Cole Trudo and Madelyn Wood, who were unable to attend tonight. Ms. Liccese-Torres stated that the documentary premiered at AIM last week and the County Board watched a clip of the video and congratulated the students at the Board hearing yesterday. The pilot video offers highlights of the importance of the Civil War forts to Arlington history. The HALRB viewed the video in its entirety.

The HALRB congratulated Mr. Karamyshev (and his absent colleagues) and Mr. Bynum. Ms. Liccese-Torres presented them with Certificates of Appreciation for their efforts towards documenting historic Arlington.

BLUE GOOSE HISTORIC MARKERS

Ms. Ballo introduced the project and welcomed Megan Pierce (Development Associate, Shooshan Company). She stated that the HALRB will review the table-top historic marker and reminded the board that the proposed marker is part of a series of interpretive signage. The HALRB should comment on text, layout, graphics, and any other issues. She added that Mr. Laporte emailed comments to staff and those edits were shared for the board’s consideration.

Ms. Pierce stated that she developed the content with the preservation staff, Bernard Berne (community activist), and Mark Benbow (History Professor, Marymount University). The goal of the table-top marker is to memorialize the Blue Goose and introduce the reader to the other interpretive signage on site. Ms. Pierce described the current design of the marker, the use of the photograph of John M. Walton (architect), and a different perspective/view of the Blue Goose building itself.

The Chairman appreciated the simplicity and the layout of the historic marker. Mr. Laporte reviewed his proposed comments with the board. He recommended identifying the person on the marker [John M.

Walton]. Ms. Pierce found the photograph of the architect from his still existing architectural office. Ms. Ballo suggested sharing the photograph with the Center for Local History, Arlington County Library. She also recommended crediting the photograph to the appropriate individuals on the historic marker.

Mr. Wenchel asked Ms. Pierce about the origin of the name the “Blue Goose.” Ms. Pierce stated that the name came from the formation/plan of the building. She added that the CIA stated that the shape of the building reminded them of the formation of geese. Ms. Ballo requested that sources/credits be put on the marker. Mr. Woodruff suggested limiting the verbiage regarding Broyhill and Marymount, but observed there is not a lot of text on the building itself. Mr. Liebertz stated that there will be another four markers dedicated to the building: construction/design, architect, CIA, and Marymount. Mr. Laporte agreed and suggested shortening the details in the text. Mr. Liebertz added that the text from the other four historic markers may impact the text in this section; therefore, the HALRB can revisit this marker at a later date.

Mr. Matta recommended removing the term “iconic” from the first sentence. He suggested the word “distinctive.”

The Chairman added that the amount of information regarding Broyhill should be limited. Ms. Pierce stated that the Broyhill family owned the building. The Chairman recommended deleting the second sentence listing his other developments in the region.

Mr. Wenchel complimented the photograph on the marker that makes the building appear almost iconic. Mr. Liebertz listed a number of Walton’s projects in Arlington County.

Ms. Pierce stated that the materials of the marker are primarily metal, raised acrylic lettering for the “Blue Goose”, and etching of the photographs. Mr. Craig shared concerns about the effect of UV light on acrylic lettering. Ms. Steinberg asked about the requirements for ADA accessibility. Ms. Ballo replied there are no requirements for accessibility, but the County strives to make them physically accessible. Braille is not a requirement for visual accessibility. Ms. Pierce suggested applications for online walking tours. Ms. Ballo discussed recent developments in technology that will allow for notifications to be pushed to users when in proximity to an object when particular applications are on their digital device (cell phone, tablet, etc.).

Ms. Ballo recommended that the preservation staff continue to work with the applicant to clean-up the text and that the applicant return when ready with a full-sized proof and specifications regarding the marker materials. She recommended that the applicant submit drafts for the other markers simultaneously to allow for a comprehensive review. The Chairman agreed. Mr. Laporte shared concerns regarding how to guide readers through the site without creating confusion.

REPORTS OF CHAIRMAN, STAFF AND STANDING COMMITTEES

The Chairman stated that the School Board unanimously recommended the approval of the Stratford Local Historic District at its May 5 meeting. The County Board kept the request to advertise the Stratford Local Historic District on its May 14 consent agenda. The item will be heard by the Planning Commission and the County Board in June. The consideration of the designation will be heard as a regular hearing item to allow individuals to speak. The Chairman stated that the County Board held a work session last Saturday to discuss the access to Stratford (particularly the driveway traversing the rear of the building). The County Board agreed to support the access driveway. The HALRB had conditionally supported this position provided that it could be sensitively constructed. Ms. Ballo added that the driveway is not a foregone conclusion since it will require a VDOT permit and schools has not successfully shown that the fire truck can make the grade up the hill. Ms. Ballo stated that the Use Permit may be submitted in July and heard by the County Board in October or November.

The Chairman discussed a recent meeting at the Maywood Civic Association. At the request of the Civic Association, Ms. Liccese-Torres and Mr. Liebertz attended. The meeting was held to discuss the proposed demolition of a non-contributing house and to discuss reevaluating the *Maywood Historic District Design Guidelines*. The Chairman noted the neighborhood's concerns that decisions by the HALRB were "arbitrary and capricious." She stated that there are elements that could be tweaked to streamline the process.

Ms. Ballo stated that the Rappahannock Coffee case was unanimously approved by the Planning Commission. Mr. Matta added that there may be alterations to the rear wall. The community is requesting brick in lieu of the proposed block. Ms. Ballo stated that the item has been deferred due to negotiations regarding a 250 square-foot easement controlled by Arlington Village. Negotiations between the developer and Arlington Village have broken down; therefore, the developer may return to DRC to redesign the southwest corner of the building to negate the need to negotiate with Arlington Village. As a result, they may be returning to HALRB to receive an amendment to the CoA.

Ms. Ballo provided the HALRB with the *Stratford Local Historic District Design Guidelines* reviewed and approved by the School Board. The guidelines are a consensus document that all parties have agreed to for the management of this future historic district. This is the document that also was reviewed as part of the Request to Advertise by the County Board. The historic district guidelines will result in the protection of the historic resource. Staff discussed the process of review once the district is approved. Ms. Liccese-Torres thanked Ms. Ballo for her work on and dedication to this project.

Ms. Liccese-Torres reminded the HALRB that the Virginia Department of Historic Resources (VDHR) is offering certified training for members of local review boards at a number of nearby locations. The next closest training will be offered in Alexandria on June 15, 2016, from 10 AM to 4 PM.

Ms. Liccese-Torres informed the HALRB about the upcoming Multiple Property Documentation project for African American Historic Resources in Arlington County.

The meeting adjourned at 10:08 PM.