

Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board

Arlington County, Virginia

HALRB Case 15-22 (HP1500039)



A request by David & Linea Topel, owners of 2206 North Kenmore Street in the Maywood Neighborhood Historic District, to remove the existing asbestos siding on the historic building, construct a two-story addition, and request that the HALRB direct the Zoning Administrator to grant a modification on the underlying side yard setback. The north elevation of the addition is less than 6" from the property line.

For DRC (circle those present): **Robert Dudka, Charles Craig, Charles Matta, Andrew Wenchel, Tova Solo, Joan Lawrence, John Peck**

For Arlington County (circle those present): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo, John Liebertz**

Case # 15-22A Agenda Item # 3

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): David & Linea Toepel
For Applicant(s): Capstone Properties

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

1. On the historic house: please confirm whether corner boards are proposed to be installed. If so, draw them on the plans.
2. Please make the following changes for the porch on the right side elevation at the hyphen:
 - a. Replace the proposed turned wood posts with square wood posts (these should be distinct from the front porch).
 - b. Simplify the side porch railing to even spindle spacing.
 - c. Simplify the upper gable end of the of the shed porch roof (wood or cementitious fiberboard panels) facing the rear elevation.
 - d. Include the porch on drawings for the front elevation.
 - e. Include more details on the roof plan for the shed porch roof. Include the slope/pitch of the bump out facing the front elevation.
 - i. This element is shown on the concept perspective drawing but not on the current application.
3. Utilize the hardi-horz. siding on the entire addition.
4. Add water boards to the addition to distinguish from historic house.
5. Simplify board-and-batten siding on the dormers. Consider panels.
6. Include detailed drawings on how the interior spaces of the hyphen will be treated.
 - a. Need information on siding, trim pieces, etc.
 - b. Need to see how that 1'6" will be treated.
7. Please include all specification sheets:
 - a. Siding (profile, material, etc), standing seam metal roof (note spacing and crimp), trim material, asphalt shingle roof material, window and door schedule, railing material and profile.
8. Please include a site plan and calculate area of land disturbance.

Findings:

- Return to next DRC meeting
- Send to HALRB

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

- Place on consent agenda (pending submission of requested materials)

To: HALRB
From: John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner
Date: April 16, 2016
Subject: 2206 North Kenmore Street, CoA 15-22, Maywood Historic District

Background Information

The building at 2206 North Kenmore Street was built prior to ca. 1923. Around that time, the building served as a small grocery/general store operated by Ora T. Miller, who lived in the house next door at 2210 North Kenmore Street. The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the house as follows: “the three-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling rests on a solid rock-face concrete block foundation. It is clad in asbestos siding and has a hipped roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, one-bay, wood-frame front porch on square turned posts with plain brackets, and one-over-one wood-sash windows. Widow and door surrounds feature molded lintels. Other notable features include a hip-roof dormer and wide, overhanging eaves.” The building is a contributing resource to the Maywood National Register Historic District. In addition, there is a garden shed built ca. 1999 towards the rear of the property that is a non-contributing building to the National Register Historic District. There have been limited other changes to the property.

Proposal

The subject proposal calls for a number of alterations to the existing house, demolition of a small rear addition (built between 1929 and 1936), and construction of a two-story addition.

The following changes are proposed on the historic dwelling:

1. Overall
 - a. Removal of the asbestos shingle siding and the repair or in-kind replacement of the existing double worked wood siding.
 - i. Replacement of the existing wood siding will require staff approval.
 - b. Demolition of a one-story shed roof addition on the west (rear) elevation.
2. East (façade) elevation
 - i. Replacement of the asphalt-shingled porch roof with a standing seam metal roof.

The applicant proposes to construct a two-story addition to the rear of the dwelling. The addition capitalizes on the grade of the property and will be 6” below the ridgeline of the one-story historic building. It consists of the following elements:

1. One-story hyphen on the rear of the historic house.
 - a. Overall
 - i. The hyphen is setback 1’6” from the historic house on both the north and south (side) elevations.
 - ii. Asphalt-shingle hipped roof (there is no visible break between the roof of the hyphen and addition).
 - iii. Clad in 7” exposure horizontal wood siding.
 - b. North Elevation
 - i. A small porch (8’8 x 5’) provides access to an eight-light wood door.

- ii. The porch roof will be supported by square chamfered wood posts to distinguish from the more ornate turned wood posts on the historic house.
- c. South elevation
 - i. No fenestration.
- 2. Two-story addition
 - a. Overall
 - i. The addition is the same width of the historic house (extends 1'6" from the hyphen on both the north and south elevations.)
 - ii. Asphalt-shingle hipped roof (there is no visible break between the roof of the hyphen and addition).
 - iii. Clad in 7-inch exposure wood siding.
 - iv. Parged concrete foundation with drip edge.
 - b. North Elevation (side)
 - i. The north elevation consists of a modified jerkinhead wall dormer.
 - ii. First story
 - 1. Paired one-over-one, double-hung, wood windows.
 - 2. Single-light wood casement window.
 - iii. Second story/wall dormer
 - 1. Paired one-over-one double-hung windows.
 - 2. One-over-one double-hung window.
 - 3. Wood panels.
 - iv. Modified jerkinhead dormer
 - 1. Standing seam metal roof.
 - c. West Elevation (rear)
 - i. The rear elevation has a gable wall dormer matching the dormer on the façade of the historic house.
 - ii. First story (three bays)
 - 1. Central eight-light wood door flanked by one-over-one double-hung wood windows.
 - iii. Second Story/Wall Dormer
 - 1. One-over-one double-hung wood window.
 - iv. Gable Dormer
 - 1. Asphalt shingle roof.
 - d. South Elevation (side)
 - i. The south elevation consists of a modified jerkinhead wall dormer.
 - ii. First story
 - 1. Paired one-over-one, double-hung, wood windows.
 - 2. Single one-over-one, double-hung, wood window.
 - iii. Second story/wall dormer
 - 1. Paired one-over-one, double-hung, wood windows.
 - 2. Single one-over-one, double-hung, wood window.
 - 3. Wood panels.
 - iv. Modified jerkinhead dormer
 - 1. Standing seam metal roof.

Staff Analysis of the Proposed Design

The proposed design complements the historic character of the original store/dwelling. The character-defining features of the building on the façade are retained and/or exposed (removal of the asbestos siding). The hyphen and two-story addition are successfully differentiated from the historic house by means of the following elements: massing (the roof of the hyphen and addition are 6” lower than the ridge of the historic house); setback (the hyphen is setback 1’6” from the north and south elevations), siding (the 7-inch exposure horizontal wood siding); and design of the side porch.

Staff supports the use of standing seam metal on the historic house and porch if the applicant desires to alter the plans before the subsequent final submission. Sanborn Fire Insurance maps show a non-combustible roof of metal, slate, tile, or asbestos shingles. Therefore, replacing the existing asphalt shingle roof on the historic house would be appropriate.

Staff recommends that the HALRB direct the Zoning Administrator to grant a setback modification on the south (side) elevation. The addition will be less than 6” from the property line. Due to the restriction of the lot (24’2 wide), it is not possible to add a practical addition without a modification to the setback requirements. More importantly, the placement of the addition allows it to be subservient to the historic dwelling, consistent with the existing streetscape, and adheres to the historic district design guidelines.

DRC Review

The DRC heard this case at its April 2016 meeting. Historic Preservation Program (HPP) staff and the DRC had concerns about the number of new materials on the addition and requested that the applicant simplify the design in order to better compliment the historic building. The committee suggested other potential ways to further differentiate the historic building from the addition. These included returning to square chamfered wood posts on the side porch and utilizing a water table on the rear addition. The DRC supported the requested setback modification. Staff requested that the applicant provide additional drawings showing the side elevations of the hyphen and all specification sheets.

The DRC recommended that this application be placed on the consent agenda for the April 20, 2016, HALRB meeting. Staff finds that this requests meets the intent of Chapter 5: Exterior Renovation and Chapter 6: New Construction and of the *Maywood Design Guidelines* and recommends approval.