

Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board

Arlington County, Virginia

HALRB Case 14-27 (HP1400046)



A request by Colin and Charu McDermott, the owners of 1612 North Quincy Street in the Fraber Historic District, to move a garage from the county-owned property to the owner's property. The proposal will require the: 1) removal of an oak tree; 2) extension of the existing driveway; 3) removal of a portion of the existing brick retaining wall; and 4) extension of the existing brick retaining wall.

For DRC (circle those present): **Robert Dudka, Charles Craig, Charles Matta, Andrew Wenchel, Tova Solo, Erin May, Joan Lawrence**

For Arlington County (circle those present): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo, John Liebertz**

Case # 14-27 Agenda Item #2

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Colin & Charu McDermott

For Applicant(s):

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

1. Provide moving plan and equipment that will be necessary
2. Provide tree removal justification letter.
 - a. Discuss with contractor potential mediations to protect tree and feasibility.
 - i. If tree removal is necessary, county forester will require 3 new trees to be planted.
 1. Appropriate species include: Black oak (*Quercus velutina*), Northern Red Oak (*Quercus rubra*), White oak (*Quercus alba*), American beech (*Fagus grandifolia*)
 2. Please state in application which species will be selected and general planting locations.

Findings:

- Return to next DRC meeting
- Send to HALRB on Discussion Agenda

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

- Place on consent agenda
- Place on discussion agenda:
- Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided
- Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):
- Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):
- No recommendation.



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: HALRB
FROM: John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: October 6, 2014
SUBJECT: 1612 North Quincy Street, Fraber House Historic District

Constructed in 1913, the dwelling at 1612 North Quincy Street is a classic example of the early-twentieth century Bungalow form. As part of the 2013 sale agreement between Arlington County and the property owners, the current proposal details relocating the historic garage associated with the dwelling from Oakgrove Park (RPC # 06-014-084) to the owner's lot (RPC # 06-014-083). The *Local Historic District Designation Form* describes the garage as follows:

Along the north side of the house in the adjacent lot that fronts 17th Street North is a detached frame garage that likewise is listed as a "contributing" historic resource in the Cherrydale National Register Historic District. Measuring one story in height, the garage rests on a continuous, smooth-faced concrete block foundation and is clad in its original drop wood siding. The front gable roof is clad in asphalt shingles and features exposed rafter tails on the eastern and western elevations. The original pair of wood sliding carriage-style doors dominates the north (front) elevation. The doors have vertical batten boards on the lower half, with eight-light fixed sash above. Both the east and west elevations have one centered six-light casement window in a wood surround. There are no openings on the rear elevation.

This proposal will require the following alterations to the property:

- 1) Extension of the existing concrete driveway.
- 2) Removal of a portion of the existing brick retaining wall.
- 3) Extension of the existing brick retaining wall.
- 4) Removal of a 28-inch diameter Black Oak tree.

Vincent Verweij, the County Forester, had evaluated the tree and noted that the tree was in fair health with a lop-sided crown and required three replacement trees. Appropriate replacement species included: Black Oak, Northern Red Oak, White Oak, and American Beech.

The DRC heard this case at its October 6, 2014, meeting. The DRC had concerns regarding the removal of the oak tree. The committee suggested the applicant consider potential remediation regarding the laying of the new garage foundation in respect to the tree and directed staff to contact the County Forester regarding preservation of the tree. Staff contacted Rachel Jackson, County Forester, who had concerns regarding the feasibility of saving the tree due to its proximity of the concrete pad to its root zone. The excavation likely would ruin half of the root zone, lead to failure of the tree, and create a safety hazard. Therefore, Ms. Jackson recommended replacement of the tree with three similar canopy trees.

The current proposal presents three options for the replacement of the Black Oak tree. Option 1 calls for the planting of one Crepe Myrtle. Option 2 includes the planting of a Crepe Myrtle and donating two Black Oak trees to neighboring Oakgrove Park. Option 3 consists of planting one Crepe Myrtle and two Black Oak trees on their property.

Staff supports none of the above options. The County Forester recommended three canopy trees (such as Black Oak, Northern Red Oak, White Oak, or American Beech) due to the species, health (condition), and size of the existing tree. Ample space for these replacement trees exists in the rear and side yards of the property. Staff advises the HALRB to follow the County Forester's recommendation. The proposed Crepe Myrtle tree can be planted in addition to three canopy trees (at the owners discretion), but is an ornamental tree and should not serve as a substitute for one of the three canopy trees. Regarding Option 2, HP Staff nor the HALRB can dictate the planting of trees outside of the boundaries of the subject property. Trees removed from the subject property are required to be replaced within its boundaries.

The DRC and staff requested the applicant include detailed moving/relocation plans in subsequent CoA applications. The applicants complied with this request. The structure will be rolled using a beam track and machinery roller system. After the structure has been aligned with the new footings, a mason will install the new foundation walls and the garage will be lowered onto the new walls.

The DRC recommended that the CoA application be placed on the discussion agenda for the October 15, 2014, HALRB meeting, but recommended approval of the CoA pending the submission of a work plan for moving the garage. Staff finds that the request to alter the landscape complies with *Fraber House Historic District Design Guidelines* and recommends approval on the condition that the applicant plants three canopy trees (Black Oak, Northern Red Oak, White Oak, and American Beech).