

Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board

Arlington County, Virginia

HALRB Case 14-06 (HP1400010)



A request by Scott Brideau & Carol Rickard-Brideau, owners of 3210 23rd Street North in the Maywood Neighborhood Historic District, to demolish a rear two-story porch (first story enclosed) and deck, and construct a two-story rear addition with a second-story porch and deck.

HALRB/Design Review Committee Report Meeting Date:

For DRC (circle those present): **Robert Dudka**, Charles Craig, Charles Matta, Darren Hannabass,

For Arlington County (circle those present): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres**, Rebecca Ballo, **John Liebertz**

Case # Agenda Item #

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s):

For Applicant(s):

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

Findings:

_____ Return to next DRC meeting

_____ Send to HALRB (see below for recommended actions)

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

_____ Place on consent agenda

_____ Place on discussion agenda:

_____ Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

_____ Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

_____ Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

_____ No recommendation.

For DRC (*highlight those present*): Robert Dudka, Charles Craig, Charles Matta, Tova Solo

For Arlington County (*highlight those present*): Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo, John Liebertz

Case #14 - 06 Agenda Item # No 1

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Carol Rickard & Scott E. Brideau

For Applicant(s): Dorothy Murdoch

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

1. Please add option for asphalt or standing seam metal roof to match front in profile, crimp (1-inch), and spacing between the joint.
2. Provide full specifications.
3. Provide profile for the siding.

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB (see below for recommended actions)

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda

Place on discussion agenda:

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

No recommendation.



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: HALRB

FROM: John Liebertz, Historic Preservation Planner

DATE: June 11, 2014

SUBJECT: 3210 23rd Street North, CoA 14-06, Maywood Historic District

This vernacular-style house was built prior to 1917. The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the house as a “two-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling [that] rests on a solid brick parged foundation. It is clad in vinyl siding and has a front-gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, three-bay, wood-frame shed-roof front porch on metal piers and one-over-one wood-sash windows. Window and door surrounds are aluminum. Other notable features include stone-facing on the first story underneath the porch, an aluminum box cornice, affixed simulated shutters on the front elevation, wide, overhanging eaves, and a single-cell addition to the east elevation.” The one-story addition on the east elevation and the two-story rear porch are evident on the 1929 *Sanborn Fire Insurance Map*. The building is listed as a contributing building in the *National Register Nomination*.

The house has undergone numerous renovations, but its 1929 footprint and massing remain intact. Prior to the establishment of the Maywood Neighborhood Historic District, the dwelling’s original one-story, flat-roof porch with second-story balustrade was demolished and replaced with the existing shed-roof porch. In 1948, the original wood siding was either removed or covered with applied simulated brick siding. In 1977, the owners added Perma-stone and aluminum siding. On the rear elevation, the first level of the two-story porch was enclosed at an unknown date. In 1992, the former owners received a CoA to remove the original tin plate shingle roof from the dwelling and install asphalt shingles. In 2003, the current applicants received a CoA to renovate the porch including adding the existing standing seam metal roof.

Prior to submitting a CoA request, the applicant and architect consulted with staff to determine the best location for a proposed addition. Staff commented that the pre-1929 one-story eastern addition has gained historic significance and is a visible component of the dwelling from the streetscape. The pre-1929 two-story rear porch has integrity issues due to the enclosure of the first story and is less visible from the public right-of-way. Therefore, staff recommended that an addition be placed on the rear of the building at its proposed location.

This proposal calls for the demolition of the partially enclosed two-story rear porch capped with a shallow shed roof and the adjacent non-historic deck. The applicant will construct a 9’6 x 15’6 two-story gable addition capped with a standing seam metal roof and a new deck. The proposed addition recalls the historic porch as the first story is enclosed and the second story consists of a screened-in sleeping porch. The addition features stock double-worked wood siding with a 5” face, four-light (simulated divided light) wood casement windows, cementitious fiberboard panels and soffits, and PVC trim. The new deck will feature IPE wood and no railings.

The submitted drawings call for “siding to match original,” which typically infers that the new siding will be matched to exactly replicate the profile of the existing siding. Dorothy Murdoch, the architect for the project, stated the following regarding the siding:

Our intent is to match the existing siding as closely as possible with available stock material. I believe this can be done within an eighth of an inch at most. I did measure the existing house siding and in fact the exposed face is 2 ½". The Smoot #117 is quite possibly an exact match. The shape is right and the dimension is right. It's possible one is thicker than the other—but without cutting out a section of existing siding, we can't know that.

Based on this information, staff supports the use of the Smoot #117 double-worked wood siding with a 5" face on the addition.

The DRC heard this case in April and June 2014. At the first DRC meeting, the applicants presented numerous design and roof options. The DRC and staff preferred the option that retained the appearance of the existing shed roof, but consented to the proposed gable roof addition. This option lowered the roof of the addition from the historic roof line and complemented the existing design of the house. The DRC requested the applicants consider expressing the columns of the existing screened porch in the new design and to study options for the upper gable end. The applicants returned for the June DRC meeting with an updated design that reflected the DRC's initial comments. Staff requested full specifications for the proposed standing seam metal roof, windows, trim, etc. All items were included in the final application. The DRC recommended approval of this application and asked that this case be placed on the consent agenda for the June 18, 2014, HALRB meeting. Staff finds that the request meets the intent of Chapter 5: Exterior Renovation and Chapter 6: New Addition/Building, Appendix C: Cement Fiberboard Siding, and Appendix D: Cellular Polyvinyl Chloride Trim of the *Maywood Design Guidelines* and recommends approval.