



DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY PLANNING, HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENT
Neighborhood Services Division

Courthouse Plaza One 2100 Clarendon Boulevard, Suite 700 Arlington, VA 22201
TEL 703.228.3830 FAX 703.228.3834 www.arlingtonva.us

DRAFT

MINUTES OF THE HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD

**Wednesday, March 21 2012
2100 Clarendon Boulevard
Lobby Conference Rooms Cherry & Dogwood**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Charles Craig
Robert Dudka
Darren Hannabass
Gerald Laporte
Joan Lawrence
Charles Matta, Vice Chairman
Mark Turnbull
Kevin Vincent
Patricia Weichmann-Morris
Andy Wenchel
Chris Wilson, Chairman
Richard Woodruff

MEMBERS EXCUSED: None

STAFF: Michael Leventhal, Preservation Coordinator
Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Preservation Planner
Rebecca Ballo, Preservation Planner

CALL TO ORDER & ROLL CALL

The Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:30 pm. Ms. Ballo called the roll and determined there was a quorum.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE FEBRUARY 15, 2011 MEETING

The Chairman called for comments on the February 15, 2012, draft meeting minutes. Mr. Craig moved to approve the minutes as presented and Ms. Weichmann-Morris seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC HEARINGS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS (CoAs)

The Chairman stated the procedures for the public hearing portion of the HALRB agenda, and noted there were four cases on the consent agenda. He called for a motion on the consent agenda. Mr. Craig moved to approve the consent agenda; Ms. Weichmann-Morris seconded the motion. It was approved unanimously.

- | | |
|-------------------|---|
| Consent Agenda | 1) 2325 North Edgewood Street
Suzanne Dunn
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 12-03 (HP1200002)
After-the-fact request to replace 10 vinyl windows with wood windows. |
| | 2) 1005 South Quinn Street
Cameron & Catherine Saadat
Harry W. Gray House
HALRB Case 12-04 (HP1200003)
Request to install board-on-board privacy fence, construct a new shed, and alter the configuration of the driveway. |
| | 3) 1307 South Monroe Street
Lorane Whitehead Ranells
Travers' Family Graveyard
HALRB Case 12-05 (HP1200004)
Request to install new grave plaque. |
| | 4) 3312 21 st Avenue North
Sean & Traci McKeever
Maywood Historic District
HALRB Case 12-06 (HP1200005)
Replace existing concrete walk and single pavers with continuous slate paver walkway. |
| Discussion Agenda | 1) 5711 4 th Street South
Peter Connell/Arlington County Department of Environmental Services
Carlin Community Hall Historic District
HALRB Case 12-01 (HP1200001)
Request for new windows, new doors, new wood siding and trim. |

The applicants for the discussion agenda item were Pete Connell and Greg Emmanuel with DES. Mr. Leventhal gave a brief introduction for the project. He said that the scope has expanded considerably since the last DRC meeting, which focused on the aspects of identifying historic wood siding, and the appropriate treatment for that siding. Since then, serious structural issues in the attic have been identified, and the

County needed to perform emergency repairs to the roof trusses to stabilize the building. At one time, there was a fire in the attic, and while the wood is stable, the structural members were rebuilt in such a way that the roof sags noticeably near the cupola. The weight of the cupola and the roof were not being adequately supported, but the repair work has stabilized the movement.

Greg Emmanuel, Deputy Director for the Facilities and Engineering Department of DES gave a presentation on the revised scope of the project. He would also like to get a sense from the HALRB about how to rebuild the front porch, as a portion will need to be demolished to access the sill for further structural repairs. He wants to understand the HALRB's concerns with this project, and to that end is looking for feedback. The vision for Carlin Hall is to have it be affordably maintained and Code compliant for years to come. He presented historic and current pictures of the front porch. They would like to redo this front porch to make it into a more functional, proper entrance. But the bigger concerns are with the structural integrity of the building. For the siding, the strategy will be to salvage what can be reused, and work with Historic Preservation staff to make that determination. ADA access will be addressed in a future Capital Improvement Plan (CIP), but would welcome HALRB feedback on that issue as well.

The Chair thanked Mr. Emmanuel and noted there was a speaker for this item.

Speaker: Randy Krug, Secretary of Glencarlyn Civic Association

- **Would like to thank staff for being accommodating and responsive to the needs of the community and users of the community hall.**
- **Nothing negative to say.**
- **Pleased with the work to the roof.**
- **Interested in continuing to work with staff and supports the staff efforts thus far.**

The Chair asked for the DRC report. Mr. Craig stated that the DRC issues had not been resolved. They need more information on the stain versus the paint. He checked with the manufacturer of the Sykkens, and many others, about the longevity of stain versus paint. All the stain products have an 8-year warranty; 10 years for the paint. Paint is an appropriate finish for a structure of this age, not a stain.

Mr. Dudka added that he met on site with Mr. Leventhal and Mr. Steinhaur from Capstone (general contractor) to focus on the degree of replacement for the siding. It seems to him that since this is a unique, historic structure, it would not be good preservation practice and would not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards to discard historic building materials. The HALRB needs more information about why all the siding needs to be removed and why it needs to be replaced if it can be repaired. Mr. Dudka added that there were no issues with the window and door replacements. The porch is interesting as it was added later, but it clearly serves a function and can be considered somewhat compatible to the building. Mr. Craig asked why all the siding needed to be removed to assess the structure.

Mr. Connell replied that there were two renovations to this building. One in 1962 after the County acquired it and one in 1988. Since 1988 they have done a wet scrape of the

building once. However, there is a lot of moisture in the wall and the siding does not have much more ability to hold paint. They want to remove all the siding so they can wrap the building and examine all the structural members. What needs to be replaced would be replaced with cypress, and what can be reused would be reused. Mr. Leventhal added that the Building Inspector wants to see the structural members of the building, plate to plate, to be sure, given the damage that has already been observed, that the structure is safe. Mr. Dudka asked how one could determine which materials are original. Mr. Leventhal stated you could examine the grain of the wood, the weight of the wood, and the profile. Mr. Matta asked if this could come back to DRC and HALRB again. Mr. Emmanuel stated that they need to get the project scoped and contracted and ready to start by June 3rd—after Glencarlyn Day when the daycare will be closed for the summer. Mr. Connell added that to help with the scope, they would like to do the selective siding removal the first week in April (April 2nd-6th) when the day care will be closed for spring break. Mr. Woodruff asked how it could be guaranteed that the siding that is fit for reuse will be returned. Mr. Connell replied it would be a piece-by-piece, on-site process, so nothing would be missed. Mr. Leventhal added that for the work over spring break, it can be observed by HALRB, HP staff, and Mr. Steinhauer. Everyone can meet on site to make the determinations. Ms. Lawrence asked what is underneath the siding. Mr. Connell replied there is nothing save some old insulation and tarpaper.

There was HALRB discussion about how to proceed with the work in a manner that allows for the best assessment of the structure and protection of the woodwork. Mr. Dudka asked if a structural engineer had fully evaluated the building. Mr. Connell replied that the County's structural engineer approved and reviewed the emergency work for the attic. The structure is stable for now.

Mr. Craig moved to have staff proceed with removing some of the siding, enough to expose the structural members to determine the extent of the damage, take pictures, and then return to DRC and the HALRB to report on the findings.

The Chair asked for a second or discussion. Mr. Vincent stated that he is concerned the siding will all be deemed hazardous and will be discarded. A rigorous assessment is needed to make sure the County will not discard the materials. He is very concerned that expense will be the motivation for the County to get rid of all the siding. Ms. Lawrence asked for clarification on the immediate scope of work to take place in April. Mr. Connell stated the work to take place the first week in April would be preliminary. They would remove enough siding to expose the sill plates and the corner structural supports, and then the siding and temporary plywood would be put back on. Ms. Weichmann-Morris stated that those issues should be fully discussed at the April DRC meeting. Mr. Wenchel added that the porch could be considered historic as of this point, and he is worried we will end up with a 'brand new, old building'. The layers of history on this building should be respected. Mr. Hannabass asked if there was a survey of water damage from the main roof planned. Mr. Emmanuel replied there was no active leaking that DES is aware of.

Mr. Dudka asked to amend the HALRB motion to include the condition that any material removed should be measured, documented, and the material saved. The

HALRB will assess the material integrity of those pieces. The amendment was adopted by acclamation. The revised motion was seconded by Mr. Dudka and also passed unanimously.

Mr. Ballo asked if the HALRB could move to approve the replacement of the windows and the doors as there were no issues with those items from the staff's or DRC's perspective. Mr. Turnbull so moved. Ms. Lawrence seconded and the motion passed unanimously. Mr. Dudka added that he wanted to compliment the County on the care they are showing to these historic structures with these complicated issues.

Before beginning the next discussion item, Ms. Ballo presented Ms. Nancy Iacomini, former HALRB Chair and member for 10 years, with a commemorative plaque for her years of dedicated service. The plaque was made from a piece of Buckingham roof slate. Ms. Iacomini thanked staff and the HALRB for the gesture, and stated that since she had recently been appointed as the HALRB liaison for Planning Commission, she would occasionally still be attending HALRB meetings for relevant items.

Discussion Item: Clarendon Circle Traffic Improvement Project

Before the presentation, Mr. Dudka asked the review board members to focus on the historic preservation aspects of the project. This project is an interesting one that will affect a major intersection, so there may be lots of comments and questions, but the HALRB should try and limit them for this update. Mr. Tom Hutchings, transportation staff with DES, gave the presentation. He described the options for new circulation routes through the circle, and discussed the possibility of moving the War Memorial in Clarendon Circle. On the whole, he stated it would be better to not move the Memorial. Mr. Laporte commented, at the conclusion of Mr. Hutchings' presentation, that it would be great for historic preservation if the curb in front of the Clarendon Citizens' Hall (a local historic district), could be moved back to where it once was. The Chair added that where sidewalks are adjacent to historic buildings, they should not be so fancy as to overwhelm the buildings. Mr. Hutchings agreed. There were no other comments. The Chair thanked Mr. Hutchings for his presentation.

Discussion Item: Sign Ordinance Amendments

Ms. Ballo gave a brief history of the project, noting that she had given the HALRB an update concerning the portion pertaining to signage in historic districts and historic signs back in 2011. Ms. Debbie Albert, CPHD, is managing the rewriting of the Sign Ordinance, and is here to give an updated report on those changes. Ms. Albert stated that these changes are driven by the County's desire to make the ordinance easier to administer and understand, streamline the entire process for owners, and be able to more readily take emerging technologies into account. There has been a great deal of public outreach already, and this meeting is part of that effort. The Request to Advertise will be in June for a July approval. Ms. Albert went through the proposed changes to Section 31A: Historic Preservation Districts. Where a CoA is required for signage, the HALRB has the sole discretion to approve the signs, even if they conflict with the rest of the Sign Ordinance, so long as they meet safety standards.

Ms. Iacomini, Planning Commission member and the HALRB liaison to the Planning Commission, asked how this would relate to buildings and facades where the HALRB is allowed to review signage by virtue of a preservation easement, but does not issue a CoA. Ms. Albert said that those signs would need to conform to the rest of Section 34 [signs] if a CoA is not required, but a number of restrictions for historic signs [as opposed to just signs that exist in historic districts] have been eased. Ms. Iacomini asked for clarification that what is being proposed would not affect the HP staff's or HALRB's ability to review signs. Ms. Albert said that was correct. There were no other comments. The HALRB supported the changes and stated they would write a letter to that effect.

REPORTS OF STAFF AND STANDING COMMITTEES

- A) Chairman's Report: The Chair introduced Mr. Nathan Uldricks, a pending new member of the HALRB, and Ms. Feruggia, a visiting preservation law student.

The Chair also reported on the recent article about building new and teardowns in the *Arlington Magazine*. A few egregious quotes include calling pre-1950s homes 'unworkable', and claiming they are 'not a house for the 21st century'. One developer is quoted as saying that, for his business, you need to find 'old junk in desirable neighborhoods'. The article was written purely from the point of view of the builder/developer/teardown community. It does not tell the preservation story of Arlington County. The Chair thought this was a good opportunity for the HALRB to write a strong letter to the Editor. Mr. Dudka stated this article is unfortunate as it does not take into account the small house movement or smarter, greener design. You can have a charming and modern house that fits the neighborhood. The HALRB agreed to write the letter with the help of staff.

- B) Survey Report: Ms. Liccese-Torres stated that he County Board heard the Calloway designation on March 10th and approved it with no issues. Staff met the church members on site the Monday after the designation. They met a man who found his grandparents' grave through the research. The County's AVN interviewed the church trustees and staff for a piece that will appear in April. For the W & OD siding, Mr. Hannabass submitted the engineer's reports. Staff will move forward with this designation in the spring and early summer.
- C) Site Plan Committee: Ms. Ballo reported that a URD had come in for the vacant lots adjacent to Broadview. The developer has agreed to seek HALRB and DRC comments on the proposed development. Meetings will begin in April in anticipation of a May DRC and HALRB hearing.
- D) Staff and other Reports: Mr. Wenchel reported that he attended the latest Reevesland meeting where staff discussed the upcoming RFP proposal. The RFP will be drafted and issues this year. The County would retain

ownership of the building. If the County fails to find a good proposal, they retain the option of subdividing the portion of the lot with the farmhouse and selling it. It would remain a local historic district.

Ms. Lawrence reported that she had had a meeting with the HALRB Chair, Ms Iacomini and others to determine how the HALRB could best weigh in on the Columbia Pike Housing Study. The plan needs to better evaluate how historic preservation is being treated, particularly as regards the HRI Essential and Important buildings. Other sites on the Pike, ones not as historically important, could take the proposed density, for example the 1960s and 1970s high-rise apartments surround by parking. On April 10th and 11th there will be another forum at Kenmore Middle School. Interested members should plan to attend.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 10:00 pm.