

Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board

Arlington County, Virginia

HALRB Case 12-07 (HP1200006)



A request by Peter & Lindsey Egge, owners of 3317 23rd Street North in the Maywood Neighborhood Historic District, for demolition and construction of rear addition, removal of side window, removal of concrete pad and steps in front, installation of 3 new skylights, and removal of brick chimney and flue vent.

For DRC (*circle those present*): **Charles Craig, Charles Matta, Darren Hannabass,**

For Arlington County (*circle those present*): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo**

Case #12 - 7 Agenda Item # No 2

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Egge

For Applicant(s): Peter Egge & Heidi Fitzharris

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

1. Reconsider alternatives to the west elevation dormer.
2. Show elevation details of “notch” on west elevation.
3. Reconsider rear elevation dormers.
4. Reconsider the railing on the front porch—consider steps across the front instead.
5. OK to remove concrete pad on front porch.
6. Reconsider “jog” in the drivestrips—consider grasscrete, or a straight, diagonal line for the drive strips.
7. Using the matching ‘triangle’ forms for the dormer additions should be reconsidered.
8. OK to not drop roofline or use different siding profile for addition.

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB (see below for recommended actions)

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda

Place on discussion agenda:

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

_____ No recommendation.

For DRC (*circle those present*): **Robert Dudka, Charles Craig, Charles Matta, Darren Hannabass,**

For Arlington County (*circle those present*): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo**

Case #12 - 7 Agenda Item # No 5

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Egge

For Applicant(s): Egge, Fitzharris

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

1. Simplify rear massing.
2. Consider gable dormers without sidewalls on west elevation.
3. Work to separate gable ends and roofs on east elevation.

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB (see below for recommended actions)

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda

Place on discussion agenda:

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

No recommendation.

For DRC (*circle those present*): **Robert Dudka, Charles Craig, Charles Matta, Darren Hannabass,**

For Arlington County (*circle those present*): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo**

Case #12 - 7 Agenda Item # No 5

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Egge

For Applicant(s): Egge, Fitzharris

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

- 1) Lower the roof.
- 2) Consider moving/altering the basement steps.
- 3) East addition mass from street- needs more identity, look at options for this mass--glazed? porch? french doors to terrace, etc.?
- 4) Look at making dormer on west more subservient.
- 5) Some DRC and staff still concnered about the approach of the massing and form of the addition. Try to give the addition its own identity

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB (see below for recommended actions)

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda

Place on discussion agenda:

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

No recommendation.

For DRC (circle those present): **Robert Dudka, Charles Craig, Charles Matta**, Darren Hannabass,

For Arlington County (circle those present): **Cynthia Liccese-Torres, Rebecca Ballo**

Case #12 - 7 Agenda Item # No 3

Application Complete

Application Incomplete

Applicant(s): Egge

For Applicant(s): Egge (brother)

(See attached application for applicant, address, name of property and property description, drawings, photographs, and proposed scope of work.)

Design Recommendations:

- 1) Prefer kneewall (panels) shown in elevation options "A".
- 2) Window at new gable—head & sill heights should match existing house. Staff prefers casement, some DRC prefer double hung.
- 3) Move chimney stack so it does not pierce the shed roof dormer. Show it in the roof plan.
- 4) Show a detail of the fascia where the new addition and the screened in porch intersect. This would be south side of the porch.
- 5) Show roof cuts at minor dormer (new dormer on west elevation) in roof plan.
- 6) Show elevations and details for proposed stone wall and stone wall with bbq insert in rear yard.
- 7) Include all cut sheets, call out all materials. If still planning to use AZEK, or equivalent, include information to comply with guidelines for using AZEK.
- 8) Show new handrail on south elevation—more of a question, it is currently shown, but without balusters. Just confirm this is correct.
- 9) Include lot coverage calculations on Sheet C-S.

Findings:

Return to next DRC meeting

Send to HALRB (see below for recommended actions)

If sent to HALRB, recommended action is:

Place on consent agenda

Place on discussion agenda:

Recommend approval of CoA, with DRC design recommendations and/or additional information provided

Recommend deferral of ruling on CoA (explanation):

Recommend denial of CoA (explanation):

No recommendation.



CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: HALRB
FROM: Rebecca Ballo
DATE: July 9, 2012
SUBJECT: 3317 23rd Street North, Case 12-07, Maywood Historic District

This is a request to construct a new two-story rear addition at 3317 23rd Street North in the Maywood Historic District. The house is a Craftsman bungalow that was constructed prior to 1918. The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the house as, “Queen Anne, pre-1918 [building]. The two-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling rests on a solid rock-face concrete-block foundation. It is clad in narrow lapped wood siding and has a front-gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, four-bay, wood-frame front porch on Tuscan columns and both nine-over-one and six-over-one wood-sash windows. Window and door surrounds feature molded lintels and projecting sills. Other notable features include wide. Overhanging eaves with exposed scroll-sawn rafter tails, and wood shingles in the gable ends.” It is listed as a contributing structure in the *National Register Nomination*.

The existing house does not have any alterations shown in the permit record. The same as its neighbor at 3321 23rd Street North (also under consideration as CoA 12-13), there have been no HALRB reviews since the district was established; the house remains largely unaltered on the exterior. Currently, the house has approximately 1660 square feet of livable space in two stories. It measures 24’ 3” by 36’ 3”, excluding the front porch. The applicants are proposing to add approximately 1600 square feet to the house, with a new 240 square foot screened porch.

The new addition will have a side-gable roof with a shed dormer in the rear. The roof height of the addition will be at the same height as the existing roof. The west elevation will have a recessed mudroom entryway. There will be a recessed dormer on the west elevation, 3’ 11” from the main roof eaveline. For the east elevation, the gable end will be designed to match the detailing and scale of the gable end on the original house, but the windows and trim details will be different. The use of square pilasters and panels on the kneewall will also help to give this part of the addition its own identity, separate from, but related to the original house. The new windows and doors will all be wood, as will the stairs and handrails. AZEK is being proposed for some trimwork in selected locations shown on the plans. The new roof will be sheathed in asphalt shingles to match the existing house. The applicant is also proposing a basement egress stairs on the rear elevation. The only changes to the historic house include the removal of a concrete pad and steps off the front porch, the addition of new skylights and the removal of one window on the east elevation.

The changes proposed to the landscape include the extension of the existing concrete driveway to the new side entry and the installation of open cell turf block pavers to the garage. The applicants are also proposing a new rear patio with planters, a stone kneewall, and a stone wall with a grill.

This application came to the DRC in April, May, June, and July. By reconfiguring the location of the screened in porch to the east elevation, the mass and orientation of the addition has become more

compatible with the historic house. Instead of creating a competing structure in the rear, the new addition now reads as a harmonious counterpart to the existing building.

The DRC did ask if the chimney flue in the rear could be relocated so as not to pierce the shed roof in such an awkward location. The applicants are proposing to use a wood burning stove which requires a flue to vent straight up. They may decide to use another stove, but would like to retain this option. Staff agrees with the DRC that the flue is in an undesirable location, and would urge the applicants to indeed consider a different stove for the future.

The DRC recommended approval of this application and asked that this case be placed on the consent agenda for the July 18, 2012, HALRB meeting. Staff finds that the request meets the intent of Chapter 6: New Addition/Building, Chapter 7: Site Elements, and Appendix D: Cellular Polyvinyl Chloride (PVC) Trim in the *Maywood Design Guideline*. Staff recommends approval.